EVALUATION OF CITIZENS' ACTION ON WATER, SANITATION AND HYGIENE (CA-WASH) PROJECT IN NAKAWA MUNICIPALITY, KAMPALA UGANDA

ENDLINE REPORT

JUNE 2017

Prepared by:

MICHEAL SEBULIBA
mmsebuliba@yahoo.com

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AEE	African Evangelistic Enterprise
CA-WASH	Citizens' Action on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
CBO	Community Based Organisation
CIDI	Community Integrated Development Initiatives
DPA	Danish People's Aid
FGD	Focus Group Discussions
KAFOC	Kampala Area Federation of Communities
KCCA	Kampala Capital City Authority
LC	Local Council
NETWAS	Network on Water and Sanitation
NDP	National Development Plan
NWSC	National Water and Sewage Corporation
PWD	Persons with Disabilities
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SMC	School Management Committee
UWASNET	Uganda Water Uganda Water and Sanitation Network
VHTs	Village Health Teams
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene

Executive Summary

Through support provided under the Danish People's AID (DPA), Community Integrated Development Initiatives (CIDI) has been implementing the *Citizens' Action on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene* (CA-WASH) project in Nakawa Municipality, Kampala, Uganda. This project aimed to contribute towards increased citizen's engagement and duty bearer's responsiveness for improved WASH service delivery in four wards of Nakawa by the end of June 2017. As part of the project logframe, DPA commissioned an end of project external evaluation. This study was intended to independently evaluate the project at its Endline stage with aim of to establishing the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of the CA-WASH project.

Key findings of the study can be summarized as follows:

Relevance: The Project is considered highly relevant as a means by which to build capacities for both the rights holders and the duty bearers to advocate for WASH services. The CA-WASH project relevance is premised primarily on the fact that it has been a participatory project that bridged the gap in government service delivery through resource provision, capacity building, advocacy, policy influencing and implementation reinforced by best practices of community participation and involvement. The chosen methods and training sessions have promoted change at individual level and community level. The members of the community can now work together to respond to their WASH and other community needs. Relevant training materials have been used to conduct trainings in local government planning and budgeting processes, advocacy, policy influencing as well as development of advocacy agenda to guide advocacy activities being executed. Training in budget tracking is relevant in achieving the project objectives, but the knowledge and skills acquired have not been applied fully because of the bureaucracy in the government structures, meaning that more practical ways of promoting penetrating these structures may be considered. There are indications however that efforts have been made by the community members to engage the decision makers at both ward and division levels.

Effectiveness and achievements: The most important achievements are considered to be: 1) improved capacity to work together at ward and division levels ; 2) in all wards of Bukoto, Banda, Mbuya and Luzira , advocacy committees have been set up and fully functional with active membership. SMC and school WASH clubs have been established which have changed attitudes in schools towards WASH and reduced levels of absenteeism by the girl child because of increased menstrual hygiene facilities. Water borne diseases like Cholera, diarrheal, typhoid and dysentery previously common in the area are reported to have reduced. Through establishment of strategic partnerships, other development partners in the field of WASH like AEE, Water AID and KAFOC have come on board and are have provided facilities like Water tanks for schools, water purifiers and building accessible water borne toilets. Finally, the amount assigned to some of the government programmes does not allow for many PWD to gain access. There is a therefore a need to intensify advocacy, provide basic information to all divisions and carry out national advocacy so that implementation guidelines make it possible for PWD to access the programmes.

Sustainability: The team finds that the quality of part of the capacity-building can already be said to be sustainable, especially since the activities that have been carried out are low-cost. This goes for the following: i) the training on personal empowerment: it is clear that an irreversible process has been initiated, providing individuals with new skills through their participation in training and self-help groups. The Team is of the opinion that the new skills acquired will be continued.

The use of VHTs and advocacy committees resident in the area will ensure that the members empowered will continue to carry on activities when funding stops. Skills acquired regarding advocacy and policy influencing are also sustainable that can be put into effective use. The project set up that empowers the community to be in charge of their development agenda anchors the benefits of the project where the knowledge and skills gained are put into use.

Based on challenges expressed by the implementing partners and beneficiaries, we recommend the following changes to the programme:

1. Advocacy committees should be encouraged to get registered as formal structures so that they can access funding from the government development programs.

2. Develop systems that promote budget tracking so that member can be to track all levels of ward, division and district.

3. The Evaluation Team finds that a second phase of the Project should take place in order to consolidate the work being done by expanding to other wards in Nakawa division.

4. The project should also be scaled up to other areas as the strategy and model used have proved a success in Nakawa division where the project has been implemented.

5. The current set up of the project can be maintained even in the areas where it is to be replicated, though with an elaborate exit strategy.

6. The advocacy committees and councillors should utilise the knowledge and skills that they have acquired in budget tracking to monitor budget performance. With this knowledge they are now better placed to question the duty bearers to provide explanation for those projects insufficiently done and areas not attended to.

1.0 Background

1.1 About the partners

Community Integrated Development Initiatives (CIDI) was founded in 1996 in Kampala, Uganda and registered in 1999 as an indigenous 'not for profit' organization. The organization was established with mandates focusing on mobilizing and empowering communities to improve their livelihood and guide them towards self-sustainability. CIDI focuses on good governance in all thematic areas. The thematic areas are WASH, health care and Sustainable Agriculture (food security and increased household incomes).

Danish People's Aid

DPA's WASH & Good Governance strategy builds on the notion that all people are legally entitled to have access to adequate water supply, sanitation and hygiene (WASH) supplied by government in accordance with international human rights law. DPA's strategy emphasizes the need to encourage and persuade governments that are not providing access to WASH for its people, to fulfil their obligations as duty bearers and be responsible and accountable to their own people. DPA supports local civil society organisations in empowering and enabling communities to demand appropriate services and to influence relevant planning and policy processes.

1.2 About the project

In April 2014, CIDI and DPA began the implementation of the Citizens' Action on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (CA-WASH) project in Nakawa Municipality, Kampala, Uganda. The project is being implemented in 4 wards of Nakawa division. The wards are Bukoto, Luzira, Mbuya and Banda.

Overall development objective *of the CA-WASH project is to:*

Contribute towards increased citizen's engagement and duty bearer's responsiveness for improved WASH service delivery in four wards of Nakawa by the end of June 2017

The project's immediate objectives are:

Objective 1:
To empower the citizens in selected wards of Nakawa municipality to actively participate and engage in local & national government planning, implementation and monitoring of WASH activities by June 2017.

Objective 2:
To strengthen the capacity of duty bearers to act on community/school WASH demands for improved service delivery in Nakawa municipality by end of June 2017.

1.3 Objective of the evaluation:

To carry out an external, independent evaluation of the project *'Citizens' Action on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (CA-WASH) in Nakawa Municipality, Kampala, Uganda'* implemented by Community Integrated Development Initiatives (CIDI - local partner) with the support of Danish People's Aid (DPA, the Danish partner) to establish the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability of the project.

2 .0 Methods of the Evaluation

The evaluation employed a cross sectional design with varied approaches in the qualitative components. The external evaluation of the CA-WASH project was conducted as a collaborative and participatory process involving a wide range of stakeholders and partners, who included the rights holders and duty bearers. The study was carried out in 5 stages namely: i) Preparatory phase ii) Field work iii) Data analysis report writing iv) Sharing the draft report to obtain in puts from the CIDI and DPA and v)Production of final report.

2.1 Approach and Methodology

The following were done in this exercise

Phase 1. Preparatory
i) Meeting CIDI
The first phase of the evaluation involved meeting with CIDI managers to obtain relevant literature and harmonise the tools developed for the external evaluation. The purpose of these meetings was to validate and get consensus on the study methodology and study tools.
ii) Review of Literature and reports: A review of existing literature on CA- WASH project was done. Other available key documents for the purpose were obtained from CIDI offices. Key outputs for this stage were; secondary data showing overall implementation of the project. The indicative information on what has been/ is being done by the project partners in execution of the project was obtained.

Phase 2: Field based assessment
Participatory techniques outlined below were used for the external evaluation. Participation of all stakeholders (rights holders and duty bearers), CBOs and community members was emphasized in data collection and analysis. The field consulting team consisted of multidisciplinary experts, representing expertise in themes areas of the evaluation. The team designated a leader and rapporteur to guide the process and ensure that key issues are addressed and regular de-briefings conducted. The participatory techniques used for field data collection included:
i) Key informant in-depth interviews:
Key informant interviews were conducted with participants who were purposively chosen for their expert knowledge of the subject being explored. Interviews were conducted using a set of developed interview guides.

ii) Focus Group Discussions:
The FGDs were conducted with the VHTs, Ward Advocacy Committees, School children, School management committees **(table 1)** to elicit information on their inclusion in the CA-WASH project , establish the gaps and barriers which limit or prevent the communities from fully participating and benefiting from the available programmes (both government and non-governmental). The evaluation team documented best practices of advocacy initiatives on access to WASH and capacity building approaches being used.

The FGD also gathered perspectives on the priorities for management capacity building and support programme, determined the resource networks, training, mentoring and support structures that community interact with, including the strengths and weaknesses of those interactions. The FGDs were further used to explore the group perception on community mobilization for inclusive WASH activities and group views on how the beneficiary communities could be supported /mobilized to increase participation in advocacy for WASH programmes.

iv) Observation during field visits:
Observational techniques were utilized as a data collection methodology in this study. Directly observed changes as a result of the project activities were done marking observations against a checklist.

Table 1: List of Organizations and Institutions interviewed

Rights Holders	Duty Bearers
CIDI	Local Councillors in LC 1 and LC 3 in Nakawa Division in wards Bukoto, Luzira, Mbuya and Banda.
Community Based Organisations (CBOs) in Nakawa	
	Kampala City Council/Kampala Capital City Authority (KCCA)
School Children from Selected Schools	National Water Sewerage Corporation (NWSC)
	School Management Committees (SMCs)
Members Village Health Teams (VHTs)	Local Councillors
Ward Advocacy Committees	PWD Councillors

2.2 Quality Assurance, Data collection and Analysis

Prior to field visits, the consulting team participated in a one day orientation meeting to fully acquaint themselves with study methodology and data collection tools. Data collection was done by evaluation assistants working with the evaluation consultant. Qualitative data was captured in notebooks and on the FGD guide.

Data analysis was done using thematic analysis, that employed word based techniques (word repetitions and key-indigenous terms) to identify themes (Ryan and Bernard, 2003). These were most suited since the nature of this evaluation fit with the characteristics of this method of analysis especially since most questions meant provision of short text answers.

3.0 Findings

3.1 Introduction

This section looks at findings and discussions of results per key indicator as reflected in the project logframe (see annexes). The key findings that are presented here relate more specifically to the project relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. In addition, the focus group discussions provide us more insights into processes, challenges and opportunities. The analysis takes into account views of partners, government and community representatives. The findings are organized in relations to purpose, objectives and envisaged outputs under each of the expected result areas of the project. They are a representation of the input of rights holders and duty bearers as well as researcher's analysis augmented by the literature review in the course of the study.

3.2 Project relevance

The stated overall objective of CA-WASH project is *"to contribute towards increased citizen's engagement and duty bearer's responsiveness for improved WASH service delivery in four wards of Nakawa by the end of June 2017"*. Basing on the situation on the ground, the assessment revealed that the overall project objective and the specific objectives of empowering the citizens in selected wards of Nakawa municipality to actively participate and engage in local & national government planning, implementation and monitoring of WASH activities and strengthening the capacity of duty bearers to act on community/school WASH demands for improved service delivery in Nakawa municipality were very valid as principles for long-term community-driven pursuits. In regard to planned project activities of the project, the problem analysis was adequate since it illustrates a logical approach which clearly defines the linkages on causes, core problem and effects. There is strong connection between the problem analysis and the project activities by result area. These interventions are rated to have been very relevant in contributing to the fulfilment of the overall objective.

Thus the CA-WASH project relevance is premised primarily on the fact that it has been a participatory project that bridged the gap in government service delivery through resource provision, capacity building, advocacy, policy influencing and implementation reinforced by best practices of community participation and involvement. In other words, the project activities fitted well within the overall existing government structures of service delivery. Whereas the government has the mandate to provide services to its citizens, social inequalities in Nakawa municipality and in the country as a whole have deprived poor communities from accessing their fair share of these services. The CA-WASH project has supported advocacy committees, sensitized and built the capacities of the local communities to plan and prioritize their needs, and voice them through their local leaders to the government and other stakeholders for action.

Government officials and other stakeholders have benefited from the capacity building initiatives organized and facilitated by CA-WASH. Initiatives by CA-WASH have brought together different stakeholders and this has facilitated ownership of the interventions at both local community and division levels. Basically the project has been relevant because it addresses peoples' core WASH needs such as enhancing hygiene and sanitation at household and community level.

Through the various networks such as African Evangelistic Enterprise (AEE), Kampala Area Federation of Communities (KAFOC), Uganda Water Uganda Water and Sanitation Network (UWASNET), Network on Water and Sanitation (NETWAS) and Child fund, the CA-WASH project has facilitated institutional strengthening, dialogue and communication between the local communities and the division assemblies. This has served as a platform for voicing the WASH needs and demands by the community.

The relevance of CA-WASH project is reflected in the following excerpts;

"…the division councillors have started to know and follow up on the areas of budget performance and are able to question on those areas that are attended to and those insufficiently done..." **Male PWD councillor, Nakawa division.**

"…People are now responsible with garbage disposal and carry it to the gazetted KCCA collection points …" Bukoto 1 **VHT/advocacy committee FGD**

"…participation in WASH trainings and dialogue meetings has equipped us with knowledge and empowered us with skills in lobbying and advocacy and also knowing the duties and responsibilities of the duty bearers and rights holders…" **SMC chairperson Nakawa division**

"…we have been empowered to educate the community on WASH issues…" **Woman councillor Nakawa**

"…schools now take WASH as a priority when school budgets for the year…" **SMC chairperson Nakawa division.**

Overall, the appraisal confirmed that the problem of insufficient WASH services in Nakawa Division in Kampala is real and the project has been relevant. The local communities in the project sites are supportive and interested in the project as are the relevant local authorities and stakeholders. The project activities have been appropriate and responsive to the needs of the Nakawa division community. CA-WASH project Staff are well informed of the WASH sector at different levels both policy and implementation. The project has been actively engaged in advocacy and capacity building initiatives and promoting creation of networks and strategic alliances.

3.3 Effectiveness and Efficiency

Accomplishment of project objectives and outcomes

The project contributed towards increased citizens' engagement and duty bearer's responsiveness for improved WASH services in the four wards of Nakawa. The project reached its target groups and participants by working with existing structures which included village health teams, advocacy committees, NGO networks, schools and duty bearers at local level. This strategy that the project pursued has been instrumental in realizing outcomes and impact by the expected result areas. The achievements in relation to the original targets set in the design document are described in table 2 below. From the assessment, the project has clearly gone a step further towards collaborating between advocacy committees and VHTs, trained citizens as part of the advocacy committees within the targeted population by empowering different groups of duty bearers and rights holders to actively engage in the project interventions. This has correspondingly facilitated an enabling environment for their meaningful participation in WASH matters that affect them directly.

Table 2: Project performance against Endline targets in logframe outputs

Output and Output indicators	Activities	Endline target	Endline achieved	Comment
Output 1.1 : Five (5) community WASH advocacy structures established & functional (four at ward level and one at municipal level) each having approximately 30 members.				
Functionality of advocacy structures (hold monthly meetings to address WASH issues)	Mobilisation and inception meetings (one in each ward, one at Municipal level and one at District level)	6	6	Achieved as planned. The 6 mobilisation meetings were completed
Output 1.2: CIDI and other WASH actors' (CBO's & networks) institutional capacity strengthened to advocate for WASH services to communities & schools.				
Number of training sessions held	Basic advocacy trainings for new WASH actors	4	4	Achieved as planned. Trainings undertaken
	Advanced training sessions in WASH policy and advocacy, WASH M&E, research and documentation	8	> 5	The last 2 were scheduled for January , 2017
Output 1.3 : The capacity of community members (direct approx. 5,120, indirect approximately 25,000) built in WASH rights, advocacy, and local government planning processes.				
	Simplification, popularization & dissemination of WASH policies (4) & other Information, Education and Communication materials (IECs)	4	3	3 policies simplified and disseminated (solid waste management 2000, Public health act and the roles and responsibilities of councillors extracted from local government act
Output 1.4 : Advocacy engagement tools developed (citizen report card, WASH maps, Community Based Monitoring (BMS) tools)				
	Conduct three (3) WASH consumer perception surveys/resource mapping (baseline survey)/KAP studies.	3	2	Funds were not sufficient to cover 3
	Dissemination meetings	18	12	Dissemination meetings merged

Output and Output indicators	Activities	Endline target	Endline achieved	Comment
	Budget tracking Manual	1	1	Achieved as planned
Output 1.5: A WASH advocacy agenda for Nakawa Municipality developed & implemented.				
No of review meetings	Holding review meetings	4	2	Review meetings merged for the four wards
No. of radio talk shows aired	Conduct radio programs	72	40	Due to high cost of airing a radio talk show, the number was reduced to 40 and 3 sets of radio spot messages, jingles were played daily for 210 days
No. of IEC materials produced	Production of IEC materials	6000 posters 40 Ludo boards 600 packets of playing cards	3000 poster 20 Ludo 240 packets	Variation in cost and increase in size of initial Ludo boards planned
Output 1.6: Advocacy engagement channels strengthened/formed.				
No. of dialogue meetings	Conduct dialogue meetings	56 (36 ward, 12 municipal, 3 district, 1 national)	53 46 Ward 5 Municipal 2 District	
No. of forum theatres conducted	Use of forum theatres	48 shows	28	Villages were merged to maximize coverage
Output 1.7: Approximately 5,000 School children sensitized and empowered to voice WASH issues				
No. of school advocacy clubs formed	Formation of school advocacy clubs	12	12	Achieved as planned
No. of IEC materials produced	Development of friendly IECs	2000 pieces	3000 (500 posters, 900 rulers, 800 bandanas, 800 book covers)	Production cost of IEC was lower than budgeted
No. of trainings	Training children in basic WASH rights	96	96	Achieved as planned
Output 2.1: WASH stakeholder map in place and utilized by advocacy structure.				
List of WASH duty bearers	Stakeholder meetings			List available
Output 2.2: User friendly advocacy manuals produced, disseminated and are in use				
Advocacy manual developed and disseminated	Develop, simplify and disseminate WASH related training manuals	1 developed 100 copies shared	1 100	Manual in place
No. of feedback sessions held	Training manual feedback	2	2	Achieved as planned
Output 2.3: One hundred (100) duty bearers' (local councillors) capacity strengthened				
No. of trainings conducted	Trainings workshops with duty bearers	8	8	Achieved as planned
Output 2.4: Advocacy forums strengthened, engagements taking place & duty bearers' (local councillors) are responsive to WASH demands.				
No. of engagement meetings	Facilitate review meetings with other WASH actors	10	9	Luzira meeting merged
No of WASH issues incorporated in Nakawa division	Preplanning meetings	3 wash issues	14	More issues from the communities were captured in the division priorities over

Output and Output indicators	Activities	Endline target	Endline achieved	Comment
				the project life
Output 2.5: One hundred (100) school duty bearers sensitized and empowered to advocate for improved school WASH				
No. of school duty bearers sensitized	Training of SMC in advocacy	100	100	Achieved as planned
No. of advocacy trainings conducted	SMC in advocacy trainings	48	48	Achieved as planned
No. of interface meetings held	Facilitate interface dialogue meetings	8	8	Achieved as planned

There has been improvement in clean water supply, hygiene, health conditions of community members and solid waste management, especially among small restaurant managers and sanitation through improved proper garbage disposal. The evaluation team found that the community and local leadership is well informed about project rationale and they are actively involved in the activities and support them. Today, the project concept is well known and currently the activities start upon request from the community mostly through other local leaders like councillors which reflect inherent decisive support from the local leadership. During the life of the project, CIDI staff has been quite active in supervising and supporting the operations of the partners and communities, giving them guidance and charging them with tasks whenever appropriate. The programme has allowed empowerment at different levels generally.

The outcomes/ effectiveness of CA-WASH project is reflected in the following excerpts:

 "…Mulimira zone was badly off in garbage collection, but after collaborating with KCCA this problem has been solved and water prices have greatly reduced where a jerry-can (20 litres) now costs sh. 100 compared to sh. 300 before CA-WASH. This was after the committee members advocated for prepaid water meters (pro-poor) and they were installed in the area.…" **Bukoto 1** VHT/ advocacy committee FGD.

Figure 1: Pro-poor water metre in Luzira ward and community centre annex building with accessible toilets under construction at Banda

Pro-poor water metre   Annex building with public toilet

"…Proper handling of food stuffs has improved, basic knowledge about personal hygiene among youth has also improved. Stray dogs which used to bite children and flying toilets are now history due to efforts of CIDI and KCCA and now all shops have where to keep garbage…" **Banda Zone B3 and B1 community members FGD**

"…we advocated and lobbied to KCCA to provide trucks to collect the garbage and the trucks now collect the garbage twice a week…" ***Luzira parish*** **VHT/advocacy committee FGD**

"…Toilet coverage has improved especially in homes and this has reduced on the problem of flying toilets…" ***Mbuya 1 parish*** **VHT/advocacy committee FGD**

"…The environment has become more conducive to the community, people now boil water for drinking which not the case before and others have got water purifiers. Children now attend class more regularly since illnesses have been tackled due to improved sanitation…" **Banda coordinator BECO.**

Table 3: Summary of achievements in the wards of Luzira, Bukoto, Mbuya and Banda

Strategy used	Achievement	Collaboration
Advocacy Trainings	• Accessibility to water (32 pro-poor pre-paid water meters were installed in Luzira, 06 in Banda, 20 in Bukoto and 42 in Mbuya).	NWSC
	• Installation of other new pro-poor pre-paid water meters has been incorporated in the KCCA budget for financial year 2017/18 (installing 24 in Luzira, 202 in Banda, 45 in Bukoto and 139 in Mbuya)	KCCA
	• General cleaning in communities (involvement of schools like Luzira Primary School, Murchison Bay Primary School and Lakeside Secondary School)	SMC Community
	• Renovation of 4 public toilets in Mawejje, Kasumba, Agatta and Caltex zones and constructed one public toilet in Port bell.	Uganda Breweries
	• Garbage collection has been worked upon in all the wards	KCCA
	• Trained in Advocacy and lobbing skills which they use to lobby for support from various offices like KCCA.	CIDI
	• Enacted of bye-laws concerning sanitation issues	Local leaders
	• Some schools in the community benefited from water purifiers (Side view and African child primary school and Mbuya C/)	CIDI, AEE,
	• Received safety gears and tools such as masks, gloves and wheelbarrows from environmental Alert to Christian Missionary Youth Group	CIDI Environment alert

In terms of Advocacy, the project has effectively responded to provide practical skills to the rights holders and duty bearers in Nakawa division to demand for improved WASH services. The strategy of working through existing government structures enhanced efficiency of the project as these constituted existing infrastructure that became a vibrant vehicle for delivery of project outcomes with lean project staff compliment.

Community mobilization has been effective as viable structures have been developed to sustain interventions in their respective areas. Capacity building has been effectively done in areas of local government planning and budgeting, budget tracking, policy influencing skills and community based M & E, solid waste management and other WASH issues key to the fulfilment of the project aims. This is predominantly owed to the dedicated CA-WASH project team to enhance the expertise existing within the partners. CA-WASH has brought added value, zeal and determination with already competencies developed.

Participation of communities and partners: The project actively promoted broad participation in the implementation and decision making processes at local level. All result areas supported awareness building through sensitization campaigns and to a much greater degree of providing information, education and communication materials on WASH issues. There is sufficient data to assert that the number of people reached with the awareness building messages reaches into the thousands, especially since some debates were broadcast on radio as well as community meetings.

Other organisations/ institutions/stakeholders: Project stakeholders were engaged through various sectoral departments depending on thematic area, for example, NWSC was engaged on water supply issues, KCCA on garbage collection and other health issues. Other organisations/institution collaborated with included; UWASNET, NETWAS, SMC, Nakawa municipality, Child fund, Uganda breweries, Environmental alert, Slum dwellers federation, and rotary club.

3.4 Impact

There is evident visibility of the project at all levels of intervention within the community and division. The visibility reflects CIDI as source of project support as well as flagging the impacts of the project. IEC materials on wash policies, posters, Playing cards, speak about all the expected results. These are coupled by sign posts of project activities within schools well as within the communities, Provision of materials like Ludo by CIDI with sensitization messages and information, brochures, hand books with sanitation information as **(Figure 2).** Advocacy Committee/VHTs agents crown it all by the various colours of T-shirts they wear marked with advocacy statement messages such as "Exemplary leaders promote good sanitation". Communities are able to identify CA WASH Project as part and parcel of either the health or water/sanitation systems.

Table 4: Impacts of project

Primary Impact

Sanitation and hygiene promotion
- Cleanliness is now being maintained in the market places within Nakawa division.
- Reduction in number of people who get sick because of poor hygiene
- Reduction in flying toilets
- Drainage systems have improved thereby improving on sanitation
- Health improvement (people no longer cook in polythene bags)
- Some people now wait for garbage trucks thus reduction in community littering
- Installation of water purification systems has led to improvement on usage of safe drinking water on schools. This was mentioned in all the wards. The usage of safe water in schools has greatly improved the health of pupils which has translated into reduced absenteeism and in turn has led to improved performance and grades.

Adequacy
- There is diversity in the interventions implemented which enables communities to have more information, capacity and skills to act on WASH demands

Secondary Impact

Rights and access
- CA-WASH has helped citizens to lobby for better water and sanitation services in Nakawa division.

Equity and inclusion
- The programme has indirectly responded to the needs of disabled students. New design of school toilets have ramps with handrail in some schools and fitted with wide doors to accommodate wheelchair users. Some also have foot pedal flush toilets. Unfortunately, some had challenge of no constant flowing water or no water flowing at all.

Policy engagement
- Programme partners report that CA-WASH has influenced other agencies in the sector, for example by encouraging them to do more on WASH issue promotion and advocacy.

Figure 2: Old and new children's toilet at Banda C/U primary school

Old Toilet   New Toilet   PWD accessible toilet

Figure 3: Sign post and water purifier at Mbuya C/U primary school

| Posters with WASH message | Water purifier |

3.6 Sustainability

The assessment of sustainability of a project is deriving from the question of whether the activities were set up to produce long lasting effects, created durable structural, institutional and organizational changes and what the risks for sustainability there are.

Measures / strategies in place: The project approach is geared towards structural changes, capacity development and the institutionalization of capacity development measures which are important factors in achieving sustainability. Communities and leaders operate with harmonized project structures, and government grassroots extension system for example the VHTs who make the advocacy committees.

Capacity: Capacity development for partners, communities and stakeholders in the areas of local government planning and budgeting processes, monitoring WASH activities and action planning on community/school WASH demands as well as other specialized technical areas were provided at both individual and institutional level. Division teams, local leaders, school children as well as the community have been trained in key project approaches –WASH Basic rights, WASH policies and advocacy- which reinforce the achievement of WASH demands for improved service delivery in Nakawa.

This was further lighted by a VHT FGD;

> *"…Using the acquired skills from the CA-WASH trainings, we shall seek for support from other organizations and institutions such as KCCA and other well-wishers, continue with sensitization of communities on WASH issues plus monitoring and proper management of the projects on WASH issues…"* **Luzira parish VHT/advocacy committee FGD**

The activities undertaken have been inherently to support sustainability by addressing structural issues, individual as well as institutional capacity development, the institutionalization of training at community level and the provision of widely accepted course materials. Besides, the use of locally available structures like SMC, VHTs, collaboration with

existing stakeholder and government staff has been cost effective and means that the areas are likely to remain within the government plans to take forward the interventions.

CIDI has played oversight facilitation and monitoring roles. Thus a combination of the capacity building initiatives and existence of various implementing and monitoring structures has provided a platform for sustainability of the projects.

Linkages: The project has created a network of players that link various structures for service support and technical guidance. There has been good networking and collaboration between CIDI and other stakeholders at both ward and division levels. This is demonstrated in the use of partners in the delivery of various services. Viable collaboration between CA-WASH project structures, and government bodies like KCCA and NWSC reinforced synergy in delivering project outcomes. This therefore will not distinguish ownership of deliverables post project but reflect collective effort.

Local resource mobilisation: Communities have been able to engage in local resource mobilisation to supplement the resources received from the CA-WASH project. Through private sector engagement, Banda community has been able to raise resources for construction of an annex building (under construction **Figure 1** above) at the community centre that has a provision for accessible public toilet facilities. It's envisaged that the upper part of this storied structure will be rented out to raise more resources for the community centre.

Use of volunteers and community-based institutions and government extension system has enhanced ownership of interventions at community level. Local bye-laws were established regarding operation of the project components which exerted pressure on leadership of project structures and activity committees to mete out punishment attached for non-compliance. Consequently community regulated systems have been developed as vehicles for sustaining activities.

3.7 Key lessons and challenges

The following key learnings was generated from the findings;

- Creation of partnerships and networking are key to the success for local led community development initiatives. When partner NGOs and the local community work together, it is easier for communities to own initiatives thus creating sustainability. The community members are able to see themselves as both agents and drivers of change working as a team to achieve the set goals.

- Communities are capable of managing their own community developments; what they need is thorough mentoring, guidance and continued encouragement to take up the challenges of implementation and monitoring. The project has been able to spur community ownership through various interfaces for enhanced capacity building.

- Entry through the existing structures minimizes overlapping of projects in the community and prevents confusion among community members. On the other hand, good networking and collaboration between partners working within the same catchment area creates a favourable environment for implementation and synergy.

- There is hidden potential within communities which can only be tapped if they have been given a conducive environment to demonstrate that potential. Scaling up and replication of project activities is mirrored, for example, in local leadership sensitization even in villages not directly targeted by the CA-WASH project that would enable scaling up of WASH activities in other divisions.

- Technical backstopping including supervision is indispensable at every level of project: community, wards, division, and project implementation unit for efficient and effective delivery of results.

- Hard working and committed community volunteers play a vital role in program implementation; capacity building (trainings, monitoring, facilitative supervision, guidance and incentives) are the key tools to community volunteers dedication in community service delivery. Volunteers if empowered with skills can drive the development agenda and produce results with minimal support at community level.

- Investments in community mobilizers, (public health motivators/ mobilizers/ VHTs) to achieve sanitation and hygiene promotion goals in project operation areas and host populations is also crucial for project success (small cost - huge returns).

- Communities are able to identify and agree on what can and cannot work well for them given the prevailing local circumstances to ensure their priorities are met and that sustainable flow of development activities is ensured.

- The first responders in any situation are the local people. They are there, they are living it and they don't get a chance to leave. Already, there is a growing situation where people, rather than giving to a well-known organization, are community-to-community giving. Or they are individual-to-community giving — people build a relationship with a community in an affected place and they then give directly to that community. This dramatic paradigm shift being promoted by CIDI thus needs to be supported further.

- Strength is in numbers. With a challenge of this magnitude, CIDI should not be seen as the only ones investing in this work. CIDI is already doing this by inviting governmental funders, institutions, and private philanthropy to join them and increase funding for WASH activities in Nakawa division. Funder collaboration should be open and inclusive, not an exclusive club – because ultimately it is about maximising impact.

Challenges

- Tracking of the approved budgets has remained a challenge for effective implementation of the planned activities by the wards and the division. The advocacy committees only have access to the presented priorities. Beyond this, they don't have access to the budgets when the figures have been attached to the planned priorities. The process of approval of plans and budgets is centralised with KCCA. Copies of the approved budgets from KCCA are only sent to the offices of the division Mayor and Town Clerk. Even the councillors at ward and division levels don't have access to the budgets that have been approved by KCCA. This makes it a challenge for the communities to track the budgets since they are not made aware of funds allocated for the different projects and activities. There is much bureaucracy reported at KCCA and the communities are not provided with the necessary documentation that would enable them access the approved budget. Only the priorities that have been approved by KCCA are shared with the communities without the attaching the corresponding detailed budgets.

- Dynamic nature of the community is a challenge. People staying in rented houses keep shifting from one area of residence to another and new ones come in. Therefore there is always need for continuous training on WASH issues among the communities with the limited resources.

- Some schools have rigid academic programs that do not give priority to other school programs outside classroom setting. In so doing such projects like CA-WASH which handle issues outside class time get affected in meeting their deliverables.

3.8 Opportunities

The project components are aligned to the Uganda government National Development Plan (NDP). It is also in line with the government policies hence this would create synergy between CIDI, the communities served and the government in implementing and promoting the same programmes and activities for health lives. The strategy of utilisation of existent structures makes it possible for the activities to continue being implemented when funding ceases.

Further, the project aims are aligned to the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) number 6 of ensuring availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all. This is further supported by Goal 17.9 on Capacity-building that promotes enhancement of international support for implementing effective and targeted capacity-building in developing countries to support national plans to implement all the sustainable development goals, including through North-South, South-South and triangular cooperation

Leaving no-one behind is the underlying principle to be followed.

Promotion of the principle of collaborative effort as the driving principle of the project promotes the inclusion of local voices from affected populations. The recognition by the CA-WASH project that affected populations and communities should be able to have as much control as they can over what is happening within their communities and to themselves has in itself been a driver of project ownership and a catalyst to sustainability.

The CA-WASH Project has opened up more doors for engagement and scope of work hence it can be scaled up to make more impact in other divisions and districts through-out the country. That some of its interventions have already been adopted and scaled up with-in the catchment areas bears testimony to this opportunity.

 Project success has been an eye opener and springboard for communities to interface with other donors for support based on their current achievements

4.0 Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

Based on findings as presented in the previous sections, the following conclusions can be reached, structured according to the issues prioritised in the terms of the reference for the final evaluation:

Relevance: The Project is considered highly relevant as a means by which to build capacities for both the rights holders and the duty bearers to advocate for WASH services.

The chosen methods and training sessions have promoted change at individual level and community level. The members of the community can now work together to respond to their WASH and other community needs.

This means that the Project has also had a mobilising effect at division level. The training provided to the new leadership has enhanced acquisition of lobbying and advocacy skills and are able to put question and put to task service providers on any deficiencies being faced.

Relevant training materials have been used to conduct trainings in local government planning and budgeting processes, advocacy and policy influencing.

An advocacy agenda has been developed to guide advocacy activities being executed.

The project is working with CBOS in the area to spread the message on WASH. This has helped further for the messages to permeate in the community and building a critical mass.

Training in budget tracking is relevant in achieving the project objectives, though the knowledge and skills acquired have not been applied fully because of the bureaucracy in the government structures, meaning that more practical ways of promoting penetrating these structures may be considered.

There are indications however that efforts have been made by the community members to engage the decision makers at both ward and division levels.

As might be expected with a rights-based strategy, the Project falls short as concerns attending to the immediate needs for livelihood support for the community. The Evaluation team understands the pressure for immediate means that may increase income. However, the Project has been designed to build capacity, and the idea is that empowerment should, in the longer term, make the community members capable of meeting their livelihood needs with healthy lives.

Effectiveness and achievements: The most important achievements are considered to be: 1) improved capacity to work together as at ward and division levels ; 2) in all wards of Bukoto, Banda, Mbuya and Luzira , advocacy committees have been set up and fully functional with active membership. SMC and school WASH clubs have been established which have changed attitudes in schools towards WASH and reduced levels of absenteeism by the girl child because of increased menstrual hygiene facilities. Water borne diseases like Cholera, dysentery and diarrheal previously common in the area are reported to have reduced.

Through establishment of strategic partnerships other development partners in the field of WASH like AEE, Water AID have come on board and are have provided facilities like Water tanks for schools, water purifiers and building accessible water borne toilets.

If the Project is assessed according to the results indicators and the objective indicators, it is has achieved most of the set targets. The area where there are gaps is budget tracking where the community have not had the opportunity to track the budget to ensure that the WASH issues raised have been taken care of.

Sustainability

The Team finds that the quality of part of the capacity-building can already be said to be sustainable, especially since the activities carried out are low-cost. This goes for the following: i) the training on personal empowerment: it is clear that an irreversible process has initiated, providing individuals with new skills through their participation in training and self-help groups. The Team is of the opinion that the new skills acquired will be continued.

The use of VHTs and advocacy committees resident in the area will ensure that the members empowered will continue to carry on activities when funding stops. Skills acquired regarding advocacy and policy influencing are also sustainable that can be put into effective use.

The project set up that empowers the community to be in charge of their development agenda anchors the benefits of the project where the knowledge and skills gained are put into use.

4.2 Recommendations

Based on the observations made, the team makes the following recommendation;

1. Advocacy committees should be encouraged to get registered as formal structures so that they can access funding from the government development programs.

2. Develop systems that promote budget tracking so that member can be to track all levels of ward, division and district.

3. The Evaluation Team finds that a second phase of the Project should take place in order to consolidate the work being done by expanding to other wards in Nakawa division.

4. The project should also be scaled up to other areas as the strategy and model used have proved a success in Nakawa division where the project has been implemented.

5. The current set up of the project can be maintained even in the areas where it is to be replicated, though with an elaborate exit strategy.

6. The advocacy committees and councillors should utilise the knowledge and skills that they have acquired in budget tracking to monitor budget performance. With this knowledge they are now better placed to question the duty bearers to provide explanation for those projects insufficiently done and areas not attended to.

References

1. Citizens' Action on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (CA-WASH) in Nakawa Municipality, Kampala, Uganda project proposal by CIDI
2. CIDI project logframe
3. A Qualitative Framework for Collecting and Analyzing Data in Focus Group Research
4. DaRos-Voseles, D. A., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Collins, K. M. T. (2003). Graduate cooperative
5. Groups: Role of perfectionism. *Academic Exchange Quarterly*, *7*, 307–311.
6. Duggleby, W. (2005). What about focus group interaction data? *Qualitative Health Research*, *15*,
7. 832–840
8. Dr. Christopher E. Sunday , Qualitative Data Analysis (QDA)

Annexes

Annex 1: Tools for Data Collection

CIDI - National Office   Checklist.do

FGDs tool for Advocacy Committee

FGDs tool for Community member

FGDs tool for school children -

Interview guide for School   managem

Key Informant interview guide – K

Key Informant interview guide – U

Key Informant interview guide – C

Annex 2: CA-WASH Logframe

CA-WASH Logframe.doc

Annex 3: Terms of Reference

CA-WASH - TOR-external evalua