



BUILDING THE CAPACITY OF CIVIL SOCIETY IN TANZANIA ON WASH GOVERNANCE FOR IMPROVED SERVICE DELIVERY



**Final Evaluation Report
July 2018**

**Prepared by
Judith Omondi
Judith.omondi2@gmail.com**

Table of Contents

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
ACRONYMS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. BACKGROUND.....	8
1.2. IMPLEMENTATION CONTEXT.....	9
1.3. PROJECT TARGETS	9
2. METHODOLOGY	10
2.1. GENERAL METHODOLOGY CAPACITY TYPE CHAPTER LEVEL (LEVEL 2).....	10
2.2. CAPACITY ASSESSMENTS TYPE CHAPTER LEVEL (LEVEL 2).....	11
3. PROGRESS OF ACHIEVEMENTS TOWARDS PROJECT OBJECTIVE	11
3.1. OBJECTIVE 1: STRENGTHENED EFFECTIVE CIVIL SOCIETY PARTICIPATION IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT WASH PLANNING AND BUDGETING PROCESSES AND INCREASED EFFECTIVE ACCOUNTABILITY	11
3.1.1. <i>Urban Component (Dar es Salaam)</i>	11
3.1.2. <i>Rural Component (Karatu)</i>	12
3.1.3. <i>School WASH Education</i>	13
3.2. OBJECTIVE 2: STRENGTHENED CIVIL SOCIETY EFFECTIVELY TO ADVOCATE FOR NATIONAL SANITATION AND HYGIENE POLICY	14
3.3. OBJECTIVE 3: STRENGTHENED ORGANIZATION OF TAWASANET AS A NATIONAL NETWORK FOR CIVIL SOCIETY ACTORS IN WASH SECTOR	15
3.3.1. <i>TAWASANET Organizational Capacity</i>	17
3.3.2. <i>Capacity Assessment of TAWASANET Members</i>	18
4. KEY OUTCOMES	20
4.1. RELEVANCE	20
4.2. EFFECTIVENESS.....	21
4.3. IMPACT	22
4.4. EFFICIENCY.....	22
4.5. SUSTAINABILITY.....	23
5. KEY CHALLENGES AND LESSONS.....	24
6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS).....	26
7. ANNEX	27

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This End of Project External Evaluation was contracted by Danish People' Aid (DPA) and executed by independent development consultant Judith Omondi. The review was successfully completed, in both Dar es Salaam and in Karatu District. In Dar es Salaam, special thanks go to Emmanuel Jackson, the TAWASANET National Coordinator and his team, which hosted and provided invaluable inputs to the evaluation. The consultant is especially grateful to Darius Mhawi for providing the review with a detailed conceptual and strategic overview of project implementation. The same appreciation goes to the project team at CHESO, and KDA whose field inputs were instrumental.

Much thanks are also extended to Peder Thorning of DPA who provided important administrative and technical guidance for the evaluation. The many stakeholders who took time out of their busy schedules to meet with the consultant during the evaluation are also much appreciated.

The views expressed in this report do not in any way represent the views of TAWASANET, KDA or DPA, and although care has been taken to minimize errors in the report, the review consultant takes full responsibility for any unintentional factual errors or omissions that may be in the report.

ACRONYMS

ACAT	Advocacy Capacity Assessment Tool
CBO	Community Based Organization
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CHESO	Children’s Education Society
DPA	Danish Peoples Aid
KDA	Karatu Development Association
LGA	Local Government Authority
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OD	Open Defecation
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
O&OD	Opportunities and Obstacles to Development
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
S&H	Sanitation and Hygiene
SUWODE	Siafu and Upendo Women Development Organization
TAEES	Tanzania Association of Environmental Engineers
TAWASANET	Tanzania Water and Sanitation Network
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WEPMO	Water and Environmental Projects Management Organization

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The evaluation of the project *“Building the Capacity of Civil Society in Tanzania on WASH Governance for Improved Service delivery”* was carried out during the final two weeks of July 2018. The project, implemented by the Tanzanian NGOs Tanzania Water and Sanitation Network (TAWASANET) and Karatu Development Association (KDA) with funding support from Civil Society in Development (CISU) through the Danish People’s Aid (DPA), was designed to contribute towards a stronger civil society that can effectively advocate for improved wash governance and service delivery in Tanzania. The project was implemented in various contexts (rural and urban) as well as different levels (national and local levels). At the national level, the project targeted relevant national ministries of water, health, education and local government as well as engaged in capacity building for TAWASANET and its members. At the local levels, it targeted duty bearers and rights holders in Karatu District (for the rural component) and Dar es Salaam City (for the urban component).

Findings

Relevance: The project was highly relevant for the context of WASH in Tanzania. The project, by design targeted key trigger points for stimulating systematic action in addressing the critical situation of sanitation and hygiene in Tanzania. In this regard, the project’s role in the ongoing institutionalization of sanitation and hygiene in the country’s national health policy and local government planning, has helped lay a solid foundation for long term public health gain and development. Also by the participation of rights holders in local government planning and budgeting, the project has strengthened the case for good governance and accountability.

Effectiveness: In capturing the contextual issues that were important for WASH interventions, especially with respect to methodologies used in advocacy at various levels, the project strategy proved not only relevant, but also effective in its results. For example, in the national advocacy for S&H policy, the project was effective in researching on the root cause of the problems on the ground, and utilized advocacy approach that well attracted the support of the government. The partnership model used in the project implementation also worked well. As a transitional modality, TAWASANET should form specific project partnership agreements with member organization participating in future program activities. Such partnerships would ensure that TAWASANET secretariat retains overall project management responsibility towards DPA, while systematically building the capacity of local CSOs for project management and accountability.

Impact: By addressing governance in the WASH sector, the project has created an important milestone towards reaching the targets of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Tanzania. It was evident that the project had facilitated a change in conditions and practices that helped to improve the health status of the target populations by preventing water and sanitation related diseases, and improved local productivity. By focusing on creating and strengthening core national capacities in WASH sector governance, the project impact in terms of scalability is significant and judging from the markedly improved capacity of the WASH CSOs in Tanzania, the project has prepared the ground for sustained and effective WASH advocacy for years to come.

Efficiency: Overall, the project was designed to strategically utilize the resources at its disposal for interventions that generated multiple results at multiple levels. By targeting policy at national level and local level advocacy in urban and rural areas, the project not only maximized impact, but also set the contextual foundation for future scale up. The capacity building strategy was designed with a view to

facilitate replication across the country. Efficiency was, however, affected by lack of essential monitoring methodology and resources to support analysis on quality of project delivery and value for money, especially for local levels activities. This gap to a great extent implies that the project monitoring framework may have placed more focus on outputs rather than outcomes. Future programming should therefore place stronger emphasis on outcome oriented monitoring.

Sustainability: The project was designed with sustainability as major key consideration. Foremost, the successful outcome of the national policy review process will serve as the main government guide on how overall issues of sanitation and hygiene will be managed at all levels in Tanzania. An important consideration for sustainability is in the project capacity building strategy, which targeted TAWASANET organizational capacity, CSOs capacity in WASH and local government planning, and organizing long term structures in communities and schools. This capacity building approach will support sustainability by strengthening the WASH community of practice from the core in addition to future scale-up activities.

Key challenges

- **Funding Opportunities** - The most serious observed strategic obstacle in the project's efforts to capacitate CSO actors to effectively advocate WASH in Tanzania is the limited funding available to local WASH CSOs.
- **National vs local priorities** - Although citizen participation in local government planning was generally good in both rural and urban components, some concerns have been expressed about chances of the government implementing some community prioritized projects, due to an existing disconnect between the government's vertical accountability systems that often give funding preference to national agenda above local levels priorities.
- **Monitoring gaps** - Some gaps were experienced in monitoring and data collection during implementation. The project lacked a clear methodology to monitor or measure the quality of its local advocacy.
- **Research gap** - Although the policy review process was successfully concluded, the project had initially failed to anticipate the government's resistance to the idea of a stand-alone S&H policy, hence the need to change course midway through the process, after spending considerable amount of resources.
- **Token funding to CSOs** - The project had planned and allocated some seed funding to TAWASANET members to facilitate the initiation of their individual advocacy plans. However, the beneficiary organizations felt that the allocation may not have adequately considered the CSOs fundraising potential with respect to the financial requirements to adequately serve their advocacy plans.
- **Urban vs Rural** - The project experience in facilitating local level WASH advocacy revealed significant differences in the social characteristics of urban and rural contexts. The standard rural appraisal methodology was found to have worked well in rural areas, but was difficult to implement in the urban setting, which by contrast was characterized by a highly mobile population with weak social connections and diverse interests.

Key Recommendations

- **Capitalizing on Momentum** - Overall, TAWASANET has made encouraging progress in terms of building its organizational capacity and network. TAWASANET should now capitalize on this growth momentum by further engaging government and development partners to put their resources into strengthening WASH governance and infrastructure in the country.
- **Future interventions** - With the successful initiation of WASH policy and citizen engagement in local level planning, TAWASANET should now put more focus both in scale and scope on advocacy interventions.
- **Funding** - The increased WASH profile in the country presents opportunities for finding durable solutions to the current funding difficulties, which is critical for continuity of WASH advocacy efforts in the county.
- **Involving other sectors in governance reforms**- To further strengthen its investment in WASH governance, TAWASANET should pursue collaborations with actors in other development sectors, by engaging with their existing platforms and make the case for linking the WASH governance activities to other governance reforms in the country.
- **Follow up to S&H Policy Review**- With the S&H policy review process completed and the adoption of the revised draft National Health Policy underway, significant intellectual and financial resources will be required for its dissemination and for development of its implementation guidelines. TAWASANET will be looked upon to provide leadership and for mobilizing the resources required for this task.
- **Linking national agenda with local priorities**– In terms of addressing the disconnect between local planning and national priorities, it is felt that future advocacy, should involve members of parliament to close the accountability gap.
- **Improving Linkages with Local Level CSOs** - TAWASANET should continue to participate in and support national level advocacy dialogues while also strengthening its nationwide network through the creation of appropriate coalitions among regional, district and community level CSOs, by using the advocacy capacity it has already built in the country.
- **Leveraging impact of school clubs**- Through the project’s hygiene promotion education, school children have proved to be key advocates and influencers for WASH. As a best practice, future hygiene promotion plans should also involve a media component for school clubs similar to other advocacy platforms.
- **Partnership modality**- The project’s tripartite partnership arrangement has proved to be strong modality for donors to utilize in the medium term, to undertake an even larger scale strategic contribution to the sectors’ achievements. TAWASANET’s partnership with CHESO in the project implementation also demonstrated its capacity to manage project implementation through local partners. TAWASANET should therefore in future continue forming such specific partnership agreements with member organizations in which it retains project management responsibility towards DPA, while systematically supporting local CSOs involved in programme activities in building their capacities for project management and accountability.

1. INTRODUCTION

The evaluation of the project *“Building the Capacity of Civil Society in Tanzania on WASH Governance for Improved Service delivery”* was carried out during the final two weeks of July 2018. The project, implemented by the Tanzanian NGOs Tanzania Water and Sanitation Network (TAWASANET) and Karatu Development Association (KDA) with funding support from Civil Society in Development (CISU) through the Danish People’s Aid (DPA), was designed to contribute towards a stronger civil society that can effectively advocate for improved wash governance and service delivery in Tanzania.

TAWASANET is a national network of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) working in the water and sanitation sector in Tanzania since 2008, as a coordinating body on behalf of civil society in the WASH sector and represents them in national and international fora. The members of TAWASANET are CSOs working in the water and sanitation sector. KDA is a community based and a TAWASANET member organization working to facilitate development, including WASH in Karatu District, in northern Tanzania.

The project, which began in August 2015 with a timeframe of three years, was by its end date of 31 July 2018, expected to have achieved the following three specific objectives:

- **Objective 1:** Strengthened effective civil society participation in local government WASH planning and budgeting processes and increased effective accountability;
- **Objective 2:** Strengthened civil society to effectively advocate for a national sanitation and hygiene policy; and
- **Objective 3:** Strengthened organization of TAWASANET as the national network for civil society actors in the WASH sector.

1.1. Background¹

The project is a product of a tripartite strategic partnership between DPA, TAWASANET and KDA, created out of the need to address critical gaps in Tanzania’s WASH service delivery as well as the capacity of its civil society in advocating for improved WASH governance.

WASH gaps in Tanzania have been linked to severe negative health and development indicators, such as a high Burden of Disease with 70% of diseases being water related. Among the key WASH challenges in the country is the inadequate access to safe water and sanitation, with a discrepancy in access in rural and urban areas. WASH conditions at schools were also considered to be dire with statistics indicating that just 19% of schools in the country had clean toilets and only 11% had sufficient latrines to serve all their pupils. Girls were particularly affected by these poor WASH conditions.

The absence of a National Sanitation and Hygiene Policy was considered a major factor in the inadequate attention sanitation was receiving in the country. The failure of initial efforts to influence the government on the WASH policy agenda presented further uncertainty for the future of sanitation in the country. Likewise while decentralization had empowered local government to make key plans and decisions on WASH with consultation of civil society, there were significant skill and capacity gaps among CSOs in effectively advocating WASH governance at the local levels.

The project strategy was therefore developed to support advocacy interventions that would place WASH centrally at policy level as a key development agenda, while at the same time enhancing civic

¹ Project proposal P13

engagement in WASH at the decentralized local governance levels. In February 2016, following project kick off, a baseline survey was conducted to assess the “understanding, skills, and participation in local government planning process and WASH advocacy in TAWASANET member organizations”. The outcomes of the baseline survey were utilized for measuring project implementation results.

1.2. Implementation Context

In terms of process, most project activities were implemented and completed according to the three-year timeline notwithstanding an initial election related delay, which had prompted partners to revise forward the project start dates by a few months. The elections which took place in 2015, brought in a sharp transition with sweeping changes in the new government. For example, the Local Government ministry, a key counterpart of the project was shifted from the Prime Minister’s office to the Office of the President, a move which also involved changes in engagement protocols. Similarly, the Ministry of Health absorbed a number of other ministries, becoming a much larger institution. The changes within government also required significant efforts to build relationships with new authorities from scratch. Nevertheless, the new regime also brought considerable energy and receptiveness in the government, which boosted WASH advocacy work across the country.

1.3. Project Targets

The project was implemented in various contexts (rural and urban) as well as different levels (national and local levels). At the national level, the project targeted relevant national ministries of water, health, education and local government as well as engaged in capacity building for TAWASANET and its members engaged in WASH advocacy. At the local levels, key targets were duty bearers and rights holders in Karatu District (for the rural component) and Dar es Salaam City (for the urban component). The rural component was implemented by KDA, while the urban component was implemented by TAWASANET through a local NGO named the Children’s Education Society (CHESO). In both areas, the main beneficiaries of the project were community based organizations in selected wards and schools as right holders, with local government departments as duty bearers. Target community segments included religious leaders, traditional leaders, village councils, women leaders and other representatives. The local government authorities involved were primarily water, health and environment departmental officials. For each component, project activities were conducted in two wards and 10 schools, which brings the coverage a total of four (4) wards and 20 schools.

Table 1: Project indicators and targets

Overall Development Objective	Immediate Objective	Indicator(s)	Means of Verification
Contribute to a stronger civil society and thereby ensuring improved WASH governance and service provision by government in Tanzania	Objective 1 – Strengthened effective civil society participation in local government WASH planning and budgeting processes, and increased effective accountability.	By end of project: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 60 percent of TAWASANET members with better understanding and skills with regard to local government planning and budgeting processes - 50% of trained members have contributed in to community participation in relevant processes like O and OD. - 10 TAWASANET members have participated two years in a row to community participation LG WASH planning processes and have demanded and obtained feedback from LG 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Baseline survey - End survey report - Reflection and learning report by TAWASANET (with input from members)

by end of the project		authorities on outcome of processes.	
	Objective 2 – Strengthened civil society to effectively advocate for a national sanitation and hygiene policy.	By end of project: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A national sanitation and hygiene signed off by health ministry. - 25 TAWASANET members have implemented their local WASH advocacy plans. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Signed national policy on sanitation and hygiene. - Reflection & learning report (TAWASANET)
	Objective 3 – Strengthened organization of TAWASANET as the national network for civil society actors in the WASH sector.	By end of project: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 50 TAWASANET members have improved governance structures, management, and advocacy skills; utilizing TAWASANET services and contributing to development of the network. - 10 new TAWASANET members - Remaining part of TAWASANET reform process implemented (100%) - At least 30% increase in satisfaction of TAWASANET membership and other stakeholders 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Baseline survey - End survey report - List of TAWASANET new membership

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1. General Methodology

The evaluation was conducted in both Dar es Salaam city and Karatu District. The methodology involved a comprehensive document review on the project activities and a combination of participatory tools with a range of stakeholders notably, structured interviews, WASH knowledge tests for school children and community members, focus group discussions and a capacity assessment mini-workshop for a sample group of TAWASANET member organizations. The mixed methods approach was especially useful in addressing data gaps and maximizing the credibility of the evaluation findings.

The evaluation was throughout guided by the project log frame summarizing the expected delivery, as well as the outlined project progress indicators. Analysis was carried out through field level observations and triangulation of data obtained from the project baseline and end surveys, using the OECD guidelines for evaluation of development assistance, to capture the project’s relevance, effectiveness, impact, efficiency and sustainability. Given its emphasis on capacity development, the evaluation especially endeavored to connect organizational change at the output level to changes at the impact level.

2.2. Capacity Assessment

The results of the capacity development of TAWASANET member organizations, were comprehensively assessed through an end survey, which examined TAWASANET member organizations’ understanding, skills and participation in local government planning processes, WASH advocacy, and the level of their satisfaction towards the network after their capacity building trainings. The external evaluation on the other hand, engaged five member organizations in a self-assessment mini workshop, which utilized the *Advocacy Capacity Assessment Tool*²(ACAT) to gain more insight into the impact of capacity building as well as to triangulate end survey results. The five participant organizations were: People’s Voice for

²The adapted version. ACAT was developed by a consortium of four international NGOs i.e. Care, HealthNET TPO, Save the Children and ZOA under the Dutch Consortium for Rehabilitation (DCR).

Development (PEVODE), Water and Environmental Projects Management Organization (WEPMO), Siafu and Upendo Women Development Organization (SUWODE), Tushiriki, and Tanzania Association of Environmental Engineers (TAEEs).

The ACAT covered four levels of organizational advocacy capacity namely i) project/program ii) Organizational, iii) Networks/linkages and iv) Individual capacities.

TAWASANET's organizational capacity was, on the other hand, assessed broadly in terms of looking at its performance at national policy review process, the quality of technical support it provided to its network membership, and the changes that its internal organizational capacity building have brought to the performance of its secretariat and board.

2.3. Limitations

There were, however some gaps and shortcomings in methodology. Due to the limited time available, the evaluation consultant experienced some difficulty scheduling meetings with local government authorities in Karatu. The evaluation also was unable to fully cover the school programme in Dar es Salaam, when a scheduled visit to a beneficiary school was frustrated by movement difficulties and delays that went beyond school closing hours at a 2.00pm. The evaluation also was affected by inadequate M&E data on project implementation at the local level.

3. PROGRESS OF ACHIEVEMENTS TOWARDS PROJECT OBJECTIVES

3.1. *Objective 1: Strengthened Effective Civil Society Participation in Local Government WASH Planning and Budgeting Processes and Increased Effective Accountability*

In Tanzania's decentralized local governance, planning and budgeting is vested with district government authorities with CSO's having the mandate to hold the government accountable and undertake overall monitoring of local development. However, according to the baseline survey, this role had not been well utilized due to the internal capacity gaps of CSOs in WASH governance. A major case for the project was that citizens did not understand the purpose of the devolved government nor their responsibilities and rights.

Under the project therefore, local level advocacy involved WASH education targeting behavior change in target communities and schools, as well as capacity building training for civil society and duty bearers in citizen participation in local government planning and budgeting processes. The project trained district health and water department official, who in turn assisted in conducting a series of trainings and dissemination to communities at ward or village levels. The trainers also facilitated Ward and/or village councils in setting up relevant committees to oversee the WASH activities.

3.1.1. Urban Component- Dar es Salaam (Implemented through CHESO)

In Dar es Salaam, the local level WASH advocacy targeted Mbagalakuu and Kichemchem but ended up also covering Mgeni-nani Ward. Consultations with stakeholders revealed positive stories of empowerment among local residents, as well as strengthened planning process. Citizens felt they had been given power to identify their own development priorities and also own government development projects.

The project was also considered to have changed the way the local government works and interacts with the citizen, by boosting local government productivity and generating positive outcomes of the civic engagement with considerable improvement in the health and sanitation of the communities. In

Dar es Salaam, the project's hygiene promotion had come as a timely intervention in facilitating not only local behavior change but also in galvanizing government support for nationwide focus on sanitation and hygiene. The project kick-off in 2015 had coincided with a cholera outbreak, which devastated part of the target population. The outbreak had been attributed to poor sanitation in unplanned areas, where due to limited road accessibility for sewage trucks, residents emptied their toilet sludge into the local Mzinga Road River in the rainy season.

Political leaders including the president responded to the advocacy voices with a number of bold gestures, including cancelling Independence Day celebrations to focus national attention on the cholera outbreak and hygiene promotion activities. The government involvement in the sensitization activities boosted the WASH advocacy work by also triggering support and contributions from local companies, which invested in drilling boreholes to provide safe drinking water in affected areas. The government further assisted target communities in garbage management, by contracting community-based companies to carry out garbage collection activities.

For beneficiary CBOs, the conceptual and technical WASH knowledge received from the project is expected to go a long way in helping them develop their respective community action plans and in generating the income required to sustain their donated water kiosks and garbage management contracts. Along with income generating activities, the beneficiary CBOs expect to join the membership of TAWASANET once they complete the registration of their legal and user agreements, a step which will further increase the scope of their sustainability. The beneficiary wards also have formed a learning platform where they and engage with other wards to share knowledge and act as ambassadors of health and hygiene promotion.

3.1.2. Rural Component - Karatu (Implemented through KDA)

Likewise, the project's WASH advocacy in Karatu's two target wards was credited with creating a greater level of awareness among citizens and improved responsiveness and accountability among local district authorities, which included equity in terms of allocation of ward development funds in accordance to size and population. According to citizens consulted, it was the education from the project that triggered action for the local ward and village councils to perform their roles in planning and budgeting and also to understand their rights and obligations as citizens with respect to their environment.

In terms of hygiene promotion activities, all (100%) households in the target areas were confirmed to have constructed their own toilets by the end of the project, in addition to acquiring and using a locally invented hand washing water dispenser (christened *dumu chirizi* or *tippy tap*).

On its part, the health department had also trained local hospital staff and improved its hygiene practices, including setting up hand washing points in specific locations with anti-bacterial soap.

The WASH education also engaged communities in tree planting at all natural water sources, in households and other designated public places. The tree seedlings were provided through partnership with the Karatu based Ngorongoro Conservation Authority, which went further to create its own initiative with similar community level partnerships in other parts of the district beyond the project target area.

Prior to the project, KDA had unsuccessfully attempted to influence change through the construction of model toilet facilities for domestic use. Due to widespread open defecation practiced in the area, frequent contamination of water sources posed significant health threats to the local population,

including cholera. To reinforce the WASH education, the village councils created and enforced new environment and sanitation public orders outlawing open defecation and ordering construction of household toilets. Failure to comply with the by-laws would result in penalties which included payment of fines or prosecution at the district court.

Through the project, the local village councils also have become platforms for other community developmental activities. A local NGO, Kilimo Endelevu, has used the platforms to channel its agricultural programs to the community. Also, through the project, the village councils established welfare committees, which channel community contributions to bereaved families.

To further demonstrate ownership of their local planning process, the beneficiary communities have created an initiative of contributing cash and labour towards building local school classrooms and other community priority projects to supplement government efforts. In Rhotia Ward for example, the community built walls for classrooms and teacher quarters for two schools, while the government completed the roofing.

3.1.3. School WASH Education

The school WASH component, in both Dar es Salaam and Karatu involved hygiene training in hand washing, the safe management of drinking water, and proper use and maintenance of school compound and toilet facilities. The program also included elements of environment management and tree planting in target schools. The initial training was followed by the formation of school clubs, whereby club members were engaged in further training to enable them to independently manage WASH training activities in their school. A club was structured to ensure each classroom was represented in order to systematically convey club activities and important WASH messages.

The evaluation covered two schools in Karatu, namely Rhotia and Kainam Rhotia Primary Schools, where project results not only reflected positively in the behavior children, but also the way the schools are being managed with cleanliness and orderliness. Furthermore, pupils who underwent the project's WASH education were considered to be more disciplined and conscious in their behavior, as well as achieved better attendance and academic performance records compared with period prior to the project. Although results for the school WASH advocacy in Dar es Salaam could not be independently verified, the CHESO project team reported similar benefits in addition to reaching a national audience through a media outreach where pupils also were engaged in conducting regular WASH awareness to the wider public through the local WAPO radio.

- **Kainam Rhotia Primary School** – At the time of the evaluation, the school had a total of 421 pupils (201 boys and 220 girls). Its head teacher who had supervised the WASH program since its inception in 2015, was pleased with the results, especially in terms of boosting the school enrollment and performance levels. According to the school records, enrollment of new pupils at the school has since increased from 60 to the current 150. Performance among Grade 7 candidates had increased from 12 pupils in 2014 to 34 (14 boys and 20 girls) who passed and joined secondary schools in 2017. In 2018, the school is expecting all its 25 candidates to pass and proceed to secondary schools. Attendance had also shot up from 50 percent to 100 percent. Part of this achievement was attributed to the school's innovative use of its WASH club as a platform for engaging and persuading parents to further improve the welfare of children, by contributing cash towards school lunches and also teaching girls the dangers of female circumcision, early pregnancies and marriages. Prior to the school lunches, children went home

at lunch hours and mostly failed to return for afternoon classes due to the absence of parents at home. The school has since also recorded zero pregnancy cases.

- **Rhotia Primary School** – The results of the WASH program in the school, which has a population of 500 pupils, was also positive, but could not fully be attributed to the project, due to the activities of another donor who provided toilet facilities, a school kitchen and other aspects of WASH support. The project, was however, credited with the initiation of the hygiene promotion and school tree nursery, the main source of trees planted around the compound. Pupils looked well-groomed and were engaged in cleaning the compound. A rapid knowledge test conducted in one classroom revealed that pupils understood the principles of WASH and their importance for their health and environment. They cited also conveying the teachings to their parents and families at home. The school administration was generally happy with the pupil attendance, with exception of about 20 percent of girls linked to poverty and also menstrual hygiene management issues such as stigma from boys. The school's performance was rated as good, ranking among the top 10 schools in Karatu district during the project period.

3.2. Objective 2: Strengthened Civil Society to Effectively Advocate for a National Sanitation and Hygiene Policy³

One of the key objectives of the project was to lead advocacy efforts to ensure that a Sanitation and Hygiene (S&H) policy is in place in Tanzania. The need for a specific S&H policy as the guiding government document to determine and direct the implementation of sanitation and hygiene interventions in the country had been recognized as far back 2008, but initial advocacy efforts had hit a deadlock with government failure to adopt the proposed draft and a diminished dialogue platform at the national level. In efforts to re-energize the process, local civil society organizations, represented by TAWASANET, took on the leadership to re-engage the government⁴.

Therefore in 2016, TAWASANET under the project, organized a study to re-assess the status of the national sanitation and hygiene policy in the country. The study which involved various stakeholders including public and private sector actors, development partners and CSOs, examined and dissected the initial process to determine causes for the failure and to develop a more appropriate strategy for their advocacy to make a breakthrough. The study attributed the initial policy stagnation to a number of factors among them the lack of clarity and poor strategy in lobbying the government, which had not fully been sensitized to the importance of the policy. The failure of the stakeholders to fully follow the appropriate procedures and protocols during the process also resulted in failure to generate legitimacy within government.

The recommendations from the reports formed the basis for a new strategy, which involved a locally driven sector wide analysis through joint policy dialogue platforms. Unlike previous efforts, which were driven only by international actors, the new advocacy strategy involved a comprehensive analysis led by local WASH stakeholders through TAWASANET as part of a strategy to build local ownership and legitimacy in the eyes of the government. The strategy also involved the creation of public events with

³ More background information from "Report of the Assessment of national Sanitation and Hygiene Policy Status in Tanzania", TAWASANET, April 2016.

⁴ More information from the project document

powerful messages about the gravity and health cost of poor hygiene and sanitation conditions in the country, communicated on various platforms, which yielded political support and direct engagement of the health minister in policy dialogue fora that were organized and facilitated by TAWASANET.

During the evaluation, various stakeholder consulted including government officials confirmed TAWASANET's central role in the policy review process and as a key stakeholder in the WASH sector, having not only informed and enriched the policy dialogues through its network, but also by supporting the government in guiding and directing the review process.

According to feedback from the Ministry of Health, TAWASANET facilitated a number of stakeholder sessions, consolidating inputs from the experiences of various stakeholders and lobbying key technical staff of the health ministry at critical stages on important issues to bring to the attention of the minister. The Ministry of Health also recognized the critical role TAWASANET played in linking the government with local CSOs, which possess a wealth of knowledge on the situation on the ground through their regular interactions at the grassroots.

It was through the process, that the government was able to better understand the contextual framework that urgently demanded the development of a Sanitation and Hygiene Policy. However, the draft, which was developed could not initially be adopted as a stand-alone policy due to changes in government guidelines that only allowed one policy objective for the Ministry of Health. Further strategic engagements with the Ministry of Health yielded a suitable and likely stronger compromise for stakeholders, in which the important policy statements from the stand-alone draft were incorporated and mainstreamed into the existing (reviewed) health policy.

The flexibility of the project in this regard is commendable. At the time of the evaluation, the revised health policy containing S&H inputs had reached its final draft, and was expected to be signed off at the ministerial level. The evaluation determined that even though the key objective of a stand-alone S&H policy could not be achieved as planned, the project had adjusted itself to a more realistic and perhaps stronger target, in which hygiene and sanitation are well integrated with the health policy, through a process that enjoyed a higher level of national ownership and political support.

It could further be concluded that with the successful outcome of the policy review process and the resulting improved operating climate, the ground has been prepared for nationwide WASH advocacy work in Tanzania. There are already ongoing discussions on how to further link policy level to the Ministerial and local levels, which present new opportunities for WASH advocacy.

3.3. *Objective 3: Strengthened Organization of TAWASANET as the National Network for Civil Society Actors in the WASH Sector*

The stated objective of the project's capacity building was to strengthen TAWASANET and its network, by strengthening the collaboration between WASH CSOs and their influence on the WASH sector in Tanzania. The capacity building component, therefore, foremost targeted TAWASANET secretariat and board, and civil society organizations. The project's sought to build coherence and balance between capacity building", "advocacy" and "strategic deliveries", with the advocacy strategy based on evidence showing the positive impacts of improved WASH services. Therefore, the focus of the project on capacity building and training of organizations was with the view to build their ability to understand

stakeholders' roles and responsibilities, and effectively advocate for improved WASH services. Furthermore, the capacity building for local partners and target groups was aimed at boosting community understanding of the principles of good governance, accountability and the benefits of dialogue, with the result of a stronger civil society organizations in TAWASANET and in the targeted communities with better insights on their rights and obligations.

TAWASANET also conducted its own in-house training to strengthen its coordination and support function for member organizations in the specific areas of networking; documentation and dissemination of WASH practices; policy research and advocacy; and capacity building. This required providing training and skills to both its secretariat and board on governance and management issues. The methodology of the capacity training for both civil society organizations and TAWASANET involved a number of approaches including short lectures, group discussions, and presentations in plenary sessions. The detailed content covered in the training is tabulated below.

The outcome of the capacity building of TAWASANET and its members, based on the assessment of the external evaluation and end survey suggest significant achievements made in the improvement of both TAWASANET organizational capacity and its member organizations' advocacy capacity in local government planning skills, which were also evident in citizen participation in the of local government planning.

Table 2: Content of project capacity building trainings

Organization	Training type	Content
CSOs	WASH advocacy skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • understanding on key concepts in advocacy; • building participants' capacity to identify advocacy issues, • the approaches to effective advocacy; • and planning for advocacy work.
	citizen participation in local government planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opportunity and Obstacle to Development (O&OD) methodology, a twelve days process that assists communities to identify their development gaps and priorities; • detailed planning process; and • understanding of the LGAs accountability structure from the lowest level of the LGA to the highest level.
	Further support in boosting CSO capacities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conducting organizational capacity assessment of TAWASANET member organizations • Production of easily updatable and replicable guidelines, formats to support TAWASANET members • Action oriented capacity building of TAWASANET • members on issues identified in the assessment by the secretariat, such as internal governance, • financial management, and resource mobilization. • Ongoing follow - up support on action oriented capacity building towards members. • Facilitation of members active participation in the annual equity monitoring report preparations. • Develop a mechanic, for sharing of learnings among TAWASANET members including, through its website and zonal platforms.
TAWASANET	Internal organizational capacity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internal governance issues such as procedures, systems and process for accountability, including better understanding of the roles and separation of powers between the secretariat and the board;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Resource mobilization to address inadequate financial resources; and • Weak integration and ineffective communication among member organizations.
--	--	--

3.3.1. TAWASANET⁵Organizational Capacity

At the beginning of the project in 2015, TAWASANET had not become well recognized especially amongst the four relevant government ministries of Local Government, Water, Health, and Education, as a strong partner, due to its limited capacity and resources.

At the end of the project, however, it could be argued that TAWASANET’s image had been re-profiled, especially following its exceptional performance in successfully facilitating a national sanitation and hygiene policy review process. Through the process, TAWASANET demonstrated not only strategic leadership but also its credibility as a partner with tangible inputs and research capacity that the government could rely on. TAWASANET also has through this visibility, earned a seat at the Development Partners Group for Water, as a representative of WASH actors.

The internal governance systems within TAWASANET , according to key stakeholders, was considered to be growing stronger. Its board, which meets quarterly without fail, serves for three years at a time.

The two boards that have served during the project’s life have been credited with playing a strong oversight role by keeping track of TAWASANET organizational performance and project implementation schedules. The TAWASANET management also felt that through the learning opportunities provided by the project, the secretariat and the board had more clarity in the way they performed their separate roles and responsibilities.

The project has also been credited with contributing towards the maintenance of TAWASANET’s institutional continuity and even its core staff. For example, the Policy and Advocacy Officer, had significantly increased his relationship and networking base; expanded his capacity in the area of advocacy strategy and execution; gained communication skills for engaging and negotiating with the government on sensitive issues; enhanced his WASH knowledge and expertise including understanding the full contextual picture of Tanzania’s WASH dynamics and its key players. The TAWASANET coordinator also gained by learning an additional skill of initiating, developing and managing large partnership projects, strengthened his problem solving skills, information sharing, and leadership ability to steering partners to be accountable to the project. He also learned how to communicate with government institutions through formal communication channels and protocols, which also has added to his status within the network, government and international actors in WASH.

To further strengthen its internal governance, TAWASANET also undertook to upgrade its financial system within the first six months of the project and new strategic plan for TAWASANET for the period 2016 to 2020. By the end if the project, its financial management capacity and credibility was reported to have significantly improved after upgrading its financial software. In addition to capacity building training, TAWASANET also engaged in learning visits with other WASH networks in the region like

⁵ For additional details see Training Report on WASH Advocacy Guideline to TAWASANET Members, TAWASANET, August 2017.

UWASNET (Uganda) and or KEWASNET (Kenya) and participated in regional and international level WASH events.

Despite, the diminished dialogue platform at the national level, through the Water Sector Development Programme, the need to map potential funders is critical, and the TAWASANET Board is keen to develop the fundraising strategy and mapping opportunities for its secretariat and members. The board is also keen to build partnerships and synergy with relevant international organizations by extending its membership to them. With much of development funding increasingly now being channeled through government, TAWASANET's vision is to utilize the secretariat as a bridge to strengthen its membership by leveraging on their knowledge and strategic advantage to improve its visibility and funding base. This will be done through the creation of a consortium that will assist TAWASANET to build on its current partnership with DPA, by capitalizing on members' strengths to develop a common advocacy agenda and develop robust strategy for resource mobilization.

Part of the organizational change seen at TAWASANET includes new opportunities for the greater involvement of member organizations in the day-to-day secretariat activities, through established thematic committees, which suggests that members are increasingly involved in its decision making. Members were reported to be volunteering their time and resources to support the secretariat where staff might be overwhelmed especially in organizing events. Having reached a membership of over 50 NGOs in its network with different levels of capacity, TAWASANET has also developed a website (<http://tawasanet.or.tz/>) to serve its large audience, an organizational priority, which further demonstrates its strategic focus on reaching its potential.

TAWASANET secretariat, however remains understaffed with only four full time staff carrying out most of its work - Coordinator; Policy and Advocacy Officer; Finance officer; an administrative and logistics assistant; and one volunteer acting as WASH advisor. The secretariat lacks staff in the critical areas M&E and communication, a challenge attributed to limited funding, which also points to TAWASANET's staff welfare and retention capacity.

3.3.2. Capacity Assessment of TAWASANET Members

Level 1-Project/Programme Capacity

- **Research and Analysis** – In this area, all participating organizations demonstrated clarity and depth in various methodologies while presenting the research strategies for advocacy that they had developed for various contexts. For example, at the community level, they engaged in focus group discussions, while in others they involved other techniques like face to face and key informant interviews. This corresponded with the end survey findings that “67% of the member organizations successfully developed their WASH advocacy plan or/and policy to guide their advocacy work”.
- **Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation** - The participants also demonstrated proficiency with regard to planning advocacy work, developing clear advocacy messages and conveying them to the target audience, but some cited difficulties with political interference and engaging communities to volunteer in some community based activities. Monitoring of advocacy work was also reported to be a major limitation, with participants confirming having no dedicated M&E resources in their respective organizations. One organization reported difficulties with allocating time to test its message at the community level before implementing its advocacy

plan. The organization realized mid-way through implementation that it needed to use different languages for the local community and the school WASH programme. This challenge in M&E capacities was also reflected in the limited data collected during the evaluation from field level activities. Also linked to M&E, participants raised the need at the national level, for harmonizing the various different data collection and verification standards used by the government, CSOs and other parties, in order to address the current disparities in standards used by different WASH actors. This outcome might explain the end survey's finding that while 92% had skills on WASH advocacy to enable their organizations to facilitate WASH advocacy work in their respective areas of operation, "50% of the member organizations were perceived having high level of skills to advocate for WASH related matters, whereas 42% of member organizations were perceived to have moderate level of skills and 8% of member organization perceived as having low level of skills to advocate for WASH related matters."

- **Community Focus:** The organizations provided a number of inputs illustrating the various creative approaches and tools used by each organization to engage on activities with local government authorities and various segments of the community. However, with some of the local level activities involving intense fieldwork, the main constraining factor for follow through with communities and local government authorities was cited as financial demands of producing advocacy materials and conducting regular visits. Limited access to funding opportunities was considered the main challenge affecting all aspects of their WASH advocacy activities. For example, TAEs developed a new WASH project proposal following the capacity building training, but its efforts to mobilize funding for the planned project failed. TAEs, however utilized the acquired skills in other existing projects. Likewise for PEVODE, the seed money provided by the project initiated its WASH advocacy, but the organization experienced difficulty obtaining additional resources to adequately support the initiative.
- **Level 2 – Organizational Capacity:** Generally the participants felt that they had achieved a good level of organizational capacity in terms of strategic planning and management of WASH advocacy. With enhanced capacity to do their own advocacy and participate in various WASH related activities, the members felt that they were able to add value by contributing to the annual report and the equity report. The major challenge felt was the limited ability of some members to maintain full time WASH staff due to funding constraints. Another reported weakness was with proficiency in financial management software, with most organizations depending mostly on basic spreadsheets like excel or paper based ledgers. Only one organization out of the five who participated in the assessment reported being compliant with a financial management software.
- **Level 3 – External Linkages/Networks:** Participants scored themselves highly in this category and felt that their organizations had established deep roots among communities, local government authorities, and satisfactorily participated network platforms. PEVODE for example, had an established membership base from the grassroots levels, which also was the source of its community volunteers engaged in local sanitation committees. TAEs suggested having strong linkages not only within the TAWASANET network and donor organizations like USAID through the ongoing Water Resources Integration Development Initiative (WARIDI) national initiative. They also cited being connected through performance sharing meetings, and other network fora where stakeholders share information. Annual equity reports were also reported to have improved in quality during the project period due to improved quality of member contributions.

The stakeholders also expressed a good level of satisfaction with regard to their engagement with TAWASANET and its WASH network. Satisfaction mostly was expressed for the skills gained and materials produced by the project related to advocacy, such as booklets for supporting participation in local government planning, and the financial support given to them as seed funds for advocacy work. Likewise, in measuring the level of member satisfaction with TAWASANET as a key output area, the survey agreed “that 85% of the member organizations were perceived to have high satisfaction with TAWASANET operations in the WASH sector and 77% of the member organizations were perceived to have high satisfaction of being a TAWASANET member.” Nevertheless, “the survey noted that 100% of the respondent organizations were willing to contribute actively to the development of the network”.

- **Level 4 – Individual Capacities** : Under this category, the participants seemed confident in their individual WASH advocacy skills based on the training they had received through the project. They also, through the focus discussions, demonstrated a fair understanding of WASH related conceptual frameworks, research and advocacy techniques. This observation tallied with the End Survey which found that 92% of TAWASANET member organizations had acquired skills on WASH advocacy “to enable their organizations to facilitate WASH advocacy work in their respective areas of operation, while 8% of the member organizations had no adequate skills on WASH advocacy”.

In general, the evaluation observed that whilst the TAWASANET members and network had become stronger in their organizational capacities for advocacy and had achieved considerable success in using the acquired skills at the national and local levels, there is still more to be done in terms finding opportunities to strengthen other key areas such as M&E and build a solid funding base that will grow the WASH sector in Tanzania. The end survey further agrees that “while significant achievements have been made towards the project target outcomes of member organizations understanding, skills and participation on the local government planning processes, WASH advocacy, and creating member organizations’ satisfaction towards the network; the network should continue to pay attention to building strong work relationship with local government, build strong financial resource base to enable perform its role of strengthening and coordinating TAWASANET member organizations, and should review some of the operational policy clauses and procedures that could be hindering the network development, transparency and credibility

4. KEY OUTCOMES

4.1. Relevance

The project was highly relevant for the context of WASH in Tanzania.

- The project, by design targeted key trigger points for stimulating systematic action in addressing the critical situation of sanitation and hygiene in Tanzania. In this regard, the project’s role in the ongoing institutionalization of sanitation and hygiene in the country’s national health policy and local government planning, has helped lay a solid foundation for long term public health gain and development.
- By targeting the participation of rights holders local in government planning and budgeting, the project has strengthened the case for good governance and accountability. The beneficiary communities, which had no previous information or knowledge about their rights and

responsibilities as citizens in relation to the government, have learned to identify their priorities and become partners with government in managing their development issues.

- Relevance was also illustrated by addressing the immediate critical needs on the ground. Through its local level hygiene promotion activities, the project was well targeted to address specific gaps in hygiene and sanitation in communities and schools, which generated immediate tangible health benefits for target populations.
- The high percentage of CSOs expressing satisfaction in the project's capacity building support, as reflected in the external evaluation and in end survey report, also illustrates relevance. Through TAWASANET, the project supported CSOs by uplifting their profiles including providing them with seed money for initiating their advocacy.

4.2. Effectiveness

In capturing the contextual issues that were important for WASH interventions, especially with respect to methodologies used in advocacy at various levels, the project strategy proved not only relevant, but also effective in its results.

- In the national advocacy for S&H policy, the project was effective in researching on the root cause of the problems on the ground, and utilized advocacy approach that well attracted the support of the government. The project's ability to influence policy change was rooted in evidence based research and understanding of the character of the government and personalities driving processes in relevant institutions. The success achieved with the policy review process has made a good case for "friendly advocacy" with government, especially where political will exists but actionable information was lacking. It also teaches that advocacy strategies must always ensure that the government is well informed, the right procedures and communication channels are followed, and the appropriate or relevant departmental officials are appropriately engaged.
- The partnership model for the project implementation is considered to have worked well, and was well suited for the local context. By making the TAWASANET secretariat a manager of project management, the project established a mechanism that understood and supported local CSOs through their capacity constraints. This model is strongly recommended as a transitional measure that would systematically enhance the capacity of TAWASANET secretariat to engage with members, while also allowing local CSOs to learn and build their capacities for project management and accountability.
- However, the project lacked effectiveness in monitoring advocacy at the local levels. The project had sought to utilize the implementing partners CHESO and KDA, to become strong advocates in urban and rural contexts respectively, and their experience and expertise gained through the project, was to be relied upon and utilized by other WASH actors. However, the project lacked a clear methodology to monitor or measure the quality advocacy that the two organizations were carrying out and whether other actors were learning from their experiences.

4.3. Impact

- By addressing governance in the WASH sector, the project has created an important milestone towards reaching the targets of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Tanzania. This outcome is crucially important in the context of severe challenges that exist in the country's water and sanitation as well as previously slow progress on policy and regulatory structures. The project was able to revive and speed up a process which had stagnated.
- Although tangible public health data was hard to obtain from the ground, it was evident that the project had facilitated a change in conditions and practices on the ground that helped to improve the health status of the target populations, by preventing water and sanitation related diseases and improving local productivity as witnessed in the target schools.
- By focusing on creating and strengthening core national capacities in WASH sector governance, the project impact in terms of scalability is significant. To put this claim into perspective, a baseline study conducted to find out TAWASANET member organizations understanding, skills and participation in the local government planning and budgeting processes and WASH advocacy, had found generally low levels of knowledge of both policy in relation to WASH and local governance. The baseline findings had showed that only 36.4%% of the TAWASANET members had high level of WASH advocacy at policy, while only one out of 22 organizations surveyed, had participated often in WASH planning and budgeting processes at the district level. By contrast, the end survey found that 100% of organizations surveyed were aware and had engaged in WASH advocacy at policy level. It further confirmed that 85% of the member organizations were contributing to community participation in LGA WASH sector planning and budgeting processes, whereas 69% of the member organizations were participating in LGA planning and budgeting processes in their respective districts. Furthermore, 92% and 85% of the member organizations had specific skills in WASH sector and in O&OD planning and budgeting processes respectively.

4.4. Efficiency

Overall, the project was designed to strategically utilize the resources at its disposal for interventions that would generate multiple results at multiple levels.

- By targeting policy at national level and local level advocacy in urban and rural areas, the project not only maximized impact, but also set the contextual foundation for future scale up. The capacity building strategy was also designed with a view to facilitate replication across the country.
- During implementation, the project demonstrated flexibility and creativity in handling of government resistance to a stand-alone S&H policy. The change of target from stand-alone S&H policy to an integrated health, sanitation and hygiene policy was in itself a strength in terms of coordinated functionality with other health components. The project also demonstrated efficiency in devising creative advocacy approaches of engaging local authorities and citizens who were difficult to engage. In both the urban and rural contexts, the project was able to successfully generate community interest using theatre arts and other attractive strategies. In rural areas, the project further used the village council platforms to support community enforced by-laws to ensure toilet construction at each household.

- The project team identified and utilized several external opportunities to enhance efficiency. For example, in the rural component in Karatu, the project maximized its impact by combining WASH advocacy with environmental awareness, while at the same time leveraged the contribution of other actors outside the project, such as the Ngorongoro Conservation Authority. Likewise in the urban component in Dar es Salaam, efficiency was demonstrated by the school children engaging the public in WASH education through the radio, as well as the collaboration between the project and other actors during the cholera intervention.
- The nature of partnership under this project has created a sense of ownership for TAWASANET, demonstrated through its proactive mentorship role for the two co-implementing partners (KDA and CHESO) and other member organizations. This also reflected in the cooperative attitude and behavior of the implementing partners, who on their part, brought to the project a wealth of knowledge and grasp of contextual WASH issues at the local level. TAWASANET's separate partnership with CHESO further suggests that it has the capacity to effectively manage implementation through local partners, a modality which should be considered for future programmes.
- Efficiency was, however, affected by lack of essential monitoring methodology and resources to support analysis on quality of project delivery and value for money. Although a number of learning and monitoring field visits were conducted and documented by TAWASANET, and solid reporting arrangements were in place, the project lacked M&E documentation at the local level. This gap to a great extent implies that the project monitoring framework may have placed more focus on outputs rather than outcomes. Future programming should therefore place stronger emphasis on outcome oriented monitoring.
- The failure of the project to adequately involve the media as a major stakeholder in the implementation process also affected efficiency. Although some components of the project, like local level advocacy in Dar es Salaam, engaged the media to enhance project results, the project design had overlooked the importance of budgeting for training and engaging media as a partner in generating and building up advocacy issues.

4.5. Sustainability

Judging from the markedly improved capacity of the WASH CSOs in Tanzania, the project has prepared the ground for sustained and effective WASH advocacy for years to come.

- The project was designed with sustainability as major key consideration. Foremost, the successful outcome of the national policy review process will serve as the main government guide how overall issues of sanitation and hygiene will be managed at all levels in Tanzania. Through the policy, the project has facilitated the recognition of sanitation and hygiene as a national priority, recognizing that the main responsibility and accountability for basic service provision rests on the government, while also providing for other WASH actors to better align with government plans.
- An important consideration for sustainability is in the project capacity building strategy, which targeted TAWASANET organizational capacity, CSOs capacity in WASH and local government planning, and long term structures in communities and schools. This capacity building approach

will support sustainability by strengthening the WASH community of practice from the core as well as escalate future scale-up activities.

- Communities consulted during the evaluation appeared to have been sufficiently involved in the process of project implementation and had assumed ownership of the post-implementation continuity. For example, target communities in Karatu were involved in sharing with the government the investment costs of local development projects through contribution of cash and labor. Through their participation in local government planning and WASH education, the project also ensured continuity by empowering local citizens to engage in ensuring accountability and long term outcomes of good governance.
- Sustainability is a major factor in the way communities have been organized as CBO in both the rural and urban components. Specific committees have been assigned to take over responsibility for the management, operation and maintenance of water and sanitation facilities as well as management of their environment. The local committees have introduced appropriate financing mechanisms by which they contribute towards their development projects such as labour and cash donations (in rural areas) or fees from water sales (at water kiosks in urban areas). In both areas, the local governance arrangements notably the CBOs and local village councils are functioning effectively with efforts being made to link some of the beneficiary CBOs to TAWASANET as members, once they complete their legal registrations and ownership rights of user groups.

5. KEY CHALLENGES AND LESSONS

- **Funding Opportunities** - The most serious observed strategic obstacle in the project's efforts to capacitate CSO actors to effectively advocate WASH in Tanzania, is the limited funding available to local WASH CSOs. While a major part of this challenge is attributed to the changing preferences of funding organizations towards partnerships, the challenge can to some extent also be linked to limited capacities among CSOs to solicit and meet the donor requirements of getting and sustaining funding. CSOs consulted during the evaluation expressed a sense of powerless, with regard to what they consider to be limited openings for funding pipelines, although they were also keen to reconsider their approach to resource mobilization. And with limited core finding to supplement project activities, most organizations are unable to maintain WASH staff on a full time basis.
- **National vs local priorities** - Although citizen participation in local government planning was generally good in both rural and urban components, some concerns have been expressed about the chances of the government implementing some community prioritized projects, due to an existing disconnect between the government's vertical accountability systems that often give funding preference to national agenda above local levels priorities. With planning at the national level considered a highly technical process not always connected to local needs, efforts should be made to initiate a process that links or matches the downward and upward planning processes to ensure they meet both national priorities and citizen needs.
- **Monitoring gaps** - Some gaps were experienced in monitoring and data collection during implementation. According to TAWASANET, the project had planned for CHESO and KDA as implementers on the ground to become strong WASH advocates whose experience and

expertise could be relied upon by other actors, but faced the difficulty of lacking a clear methodology to monitor or measure if the two organizations were carrying out quality advocacy and whether other members were learning from their experience. This weakness also was felt in the distribution of advocacy materials, where it was generally felt that the quantity used may not have adequately reached citizens in some areas. However, at the management level, learning and monitoring field visits were conducted and documented by TAWASANET, and solid reporting arrangements were in place. The gaps in monitoring, evaluation and learning, to a great extent points to more focus having been placed outputs rather than outcomes. Future programming should therefore place a stronger emphasis on outcome oriented monitoring.

- **Research gap** - Although the policy review process was successfully concluded, the project had initially failed to anticipate the government's resistance to the idea of a stand-alone S&H policy, hence the need to change course midway through the process, after spending considerable resources. This challenge would have been mitigated if the initial research had in advance identified and analyzed other potential avenues that could be pursued.
- **Token funding to CSOs** - The project had planned and allocated some seed funding to TAWASANET members to help initiate their advocacy plans. However, the beneficiary organizations felt that the allocation may not have adequately considered the CSOs fundraising potential with respect to the financial requirements for adequately covering their advocacy plans. It was also felt that the lack of uniformity in the cost of advocacy in various contexts, such as discrepancy between rural and urban cost structures, should also be considered in future project designing.
- **Confronting beliefs** - A key lesson learned from the project's rural component is that citizens can change and unlearn even the most stubborn beliefs and taboos if the right approaches for training are employed and enforced through community initiated rules. According to KDA, citizens in the target communities in Karatu had previously lacked awareness about their rights and responsibilities even though decentralization had been in place a good number of years. Most villages lacked awareness about the use of toilets, a challenge exacerbated by negative cultural beliefs and religious taboos about the communal sharing of toilets. However, it was the combination of illustrative hygiene promoting education and enforcement of village council by-laws that yielded 100% compliance in household toilet construction and eradication of OD.
- **School Children as Advocators** - With the success of the school WASH clubs, the project achieved significant health and educational benefits to children. The additional engagement of children in WASH education on local radio has demonstrated not only children's higher level of uptake and capacity for behavior change compared with the adults, but also suggests that school children can become effective WASH advocates to the general public.
- **Urban vs Rural** - The project experience in facilitating local level WASH advocacy revealed significant differences in the social characteristics of urban and rural contexts. The standard rural appraisal methodology was cited to have worked well in target rural areas, but was difficult to implement in the urban setting, which by contrast was characterized by a highly mobile population with weak social connections and diverse interests. The rural populations, considered by contrast to be more homogenous were, in this regard, easier to profile and engage, with special attention to local cultural norms and traditions. For example, among the Maasai people, the word of traditional leaders is highly valued and community engagement

strategy must foremost involve their buy-in. Citizen engagement approaches used in the urban context, therefore need to consider this fundamental difference. In Tanzania's rapidly urbanizing population, this means that WASH actors need to urgently study and develop appropriate methodologies and tools that can more effectively be used for reaching and organizing urban citizens.

6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

- **Capitalizing on Momentum** - Overall, TAWASANET has made encouraging progress in terms of building its organizational capacity and network of WASH organizations. These gains are illustrated in the strong commitment of its board and secretariat; strengthened collaboration with its member organizations and the government; increased recognition of its institutional value as an important WASH sector player in the country; and improvements in its programming and operations. Nevertheless, TAWASANET should capitalize on this momentum by further engaging government and development partners to put their resources into strengthening WASH governance and infrastructure in the country.
- **Future interventions** - With the successful initiation of WASH policy and citizen engagement in local level planning, TAWASANET should now put more focus both in scale and scope on interventions, using the lessons and successes from the project, to introduce best practices and piloting innovative approaches in difficult challenges like citizen engagement in urban areas and harmonizing M&E systems.
- **Funding** - The increased WASH profile in the country also presents opportunities for finding durable solutions to the current funding difficulties, which is critical for continuity of WASH advocacy efforts in the county. TAWASANET and its member organizations should analyze the obstacles and opportunities for improving their funding base, with a view to investing in robust engagement with potential funding sources for the WASH sector. Stakeholders must discuss how the sector can become more creative to overcome the challenges associated with conventional sources of funding and devise more effective approaches for sustainability. Better tracking of advocacy and demonstrating effectiveness and impact, can also help increase funding if done with the appropriate communication strategies.
- **Involving other sectors in governance reforms** - The project's strategy to integrate local level WASH governance with hygiene education produced very encouraging results, which brought both immediate community health benefits and changes within local governments that suggest longer term benefits from improved WASH service provision and accountability. To further strengthen its investment in WASH governance, TAWASANET should pursue collaborations with actors in other development sectors, engaging with their existing platforms and make the case for linking the WASH governance activities to other governance reforms in the country.
- **Follow up to S&H Policy Review** - With the S&H policy review process completed and the adoption of the revised draft National Health Policy underway, significant intellectual and financial resources will be required for its dissemination and for development of its implementation guidelines. TAWASANET will be looked upon to provide leadership and mobilize the resources required for this task. TAWASANET, which also stands to gain more influence in the process, should capitalize on its increased strengths and the renewed government commitment, to generate new resources for supporting these activities.

- **Linking national agenda with local priorities**—In terms of addressing the disconnect between local planning and national priorities, it was felt that future advocacy, should involve members of parliament to close the accountability gap. Members of parliament should not only be involved at the policy level, but also in supervising citizen the participation in local government planning processes.
- **Enhancing TAWASANET Connection to Local Level CSOs** - Although overall satisfaction has increased among TAWASANET membership with respect to its performance as a WASH network organization, both the external evaluation and the end survey captured sentiments of TAWASANET support focus being much more geographically concentrated at the national level, which places member organizations remotely located at the sub-national levels at a disadvantage. The end survey noted that, “there was a feeling that TAWASANET support was more active at national level, therefore, efforts should be made to ensure there is effective machinery to support WASH delivery at district level where most of the beneficiaries are based. It is therefore recommended that TAWASANET should seek ways of strengthening its nationwide network through the appropriate coalitions among regional, district and community level CSOs, using the advocacy capacity it has already built in the country. The expected balance of “national vs. local” in which TAWASANET as the network platform, concentrates at the national level while members implement at the local level and feed upwards for advocacy, must not be lost to ensure a visible line of accountability and healthy network.
- **Leveraging impact of school clubs** - Through the project’s hygiene promotion education, school children have proved to be key advocates and influencers for WASH. As a best practice, future hygiene promotion plans should also involve a media component for school clubs similar to other advocacy platforms.
- **Partnership modality** - The project’s tripartite partnership arrangement has proved to be strong modality for donors to utilize, in the medium term, to undertake an even larger scale strategic contribution to the sectors’ achievements. TAWASANET’s partnership with CHESO in the project implementation also demonstrated its capacity to manage project implementation through local partners. TAWASANET should therefore in future continue forming such specific partnership agreements with member organizations in which it retains project management responsibility towards DPA, while systematically supporting local CSOs involved in programme activities in building their capacities for project management and accountability.

7. ANNEX

ANNEX 1 - Project Log Frame & results

ANNEX 2 – List of Evaluation Participants

ANNEX 3 – TORs for External Evaluation

ANNEX 4 – List of Documents Reviewed

ANNEX 5 – TAWASANET Members ACAT Mini-workshop Results

ANNEX 6 - TAWASANET Internal Capacity Building Activities – Status

ANNEX 7 – Selected Photos