



STRENGTHENING CITIZENS' INFLUENCE ON WASH IN THE NEWLY DEVOLVED GOVERNANCE SYSTEM IN KWALE AND KILIFI COUNTIES IN KENYA



**Final Evaluation Report
January 2019**

**Prepared by
Judith Omondi
Judith.omondi2@gmail.com**

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
ACRONYMS.....	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. BACKGROUND AND IMPLEMENTATION CONTEXT	8
1.2. PROJECT TARGETS	8
2. METHODOLOGY.....	9
3. PROGRESS OF ACHIEVEMENTS TOWARDS PROJECT OBJECTIVE	11
3.1. OBJECTIVE 1: RIGHTS HOLDERS IN THE THREE COUNTIES ARE EMPOWERED TO ACTIVELY PARTICIPATE IN AND INFLUENCE COUNTY WASH PLANNING PROCESS	11
3.1.1. <i>Citizens’ Understanding of Devolution and Participation in County Planning</i>	11
3.1.2. <i>Citizen Participation in County Legislation and Policy Making</i>	12
3.2. OBJECTIVE 2: STRENGTHENED CIVIL SOCIETY EFFECTIVELY TO ADVOCATE FOR NATIONAL SANITATION AND HYGIENE POLICY	12
3.2.1. <i>School WASH Component</i>	12
3.2.2. <i>Community Participation in WASH Infrastructure Operation and Maintenance</i>	14
3.2.3. <i>Social Accountability</i>	15
3.3. OBJECTIVE 3: DUTY BEARERS HAVE IMPROVED UNDERSTANDING OF THEIR RESPONSIBILITIES WITHIN THE DEVOLVED GOVERNANCE SYSTEMS WITH REGARD TO INCLUSIVE PLANNING AND DELIVERY OF WASH SERVICES	16
4. KEY OUTCOMES	17
4.1. RELEVANCE	17
4.2. EFFECTIVENESS	17
4.3. IMPACT	18
4.4. EFFICIENCY	20
4.5. SUSTAINABILITY	20
5. KEY CHALLENGES AND LESSONS.....	20
5.1. LESSONS	20
5.2. CHALLENGES	21
6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS)	22
7. ANNEX.....	23

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This End of Project Evaluation has been conducted with support and inputs from the Danish People's Aid (DPA) and Kenya Water and Sanitation Civil Society Network (KEWASNET). It has been executed by independent development consultant Judith Omondi.

Special acknowledgements and appreciations to Peder Thorning (DPA) for the strategic guidance and administrative support provided to the consultant during the review process. Thanks also to project team members Vincent Ouma and Alex Maina (KEWASNET), who dedicated time and effort to engage with the consultant and facilitate meetings with stakeholders. Without their inputs and facilitation, this report would not have been produced. Also appreciated is the enthusiasm, commitment, and openness of the various stakeholders in Kilifi and Kwale Counties in providing the required information. Thank you County Government officials, Civil Society representatives, and the management and teachers of Isaac Nyondo Primary School for taking time to contribute to the evaluation.

The views expressed in this report do not in any way represent the views of KEWASNET or DPA, and although care has been taken to minimize errors in the report, the review consultant takes full responsibility for any unintentional factual errors or omissions that may be in the report.

ACRONYMS

BoQ	Bill of Quantities
CBO	Community Based Organization
CHAST	Child Hygiene and Sanitation Training
CIDP	County Integrated Development Plan
CLTS	Community Led Total Sanitation
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DPA	Danish Peoples Aid
GIS	Geographical Information Systems
KCNRN	Kwale/Kilifi County Natural Resource Network
KEWASNET	Kenya Water and Sanitation Network
KWTA	Kenya Water Tower Agency
KWAHO	Kenya Water for Health Organization
KWAWASCO	Kwale Water and Sewerage Company
MCA	Member of County Assembly
MNU	Maji na Ufanisi
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OD	Open Defecation
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
O&M	Operation and Maintenance
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides the findings of the final evaluation of the project: *“Strengthening Citizens’ Influence on WASH in the newly Devolved Governance System in Kwale and Kilifi Counties in Kenya.”* The two-year project, implemented by the Kenya Water and Sanitation Network (KEWASNET), with support from Danish People’s Aid (DPA) and major funding from *Danmarks Indsamling* (DI), ended in December 2018. The project’s was initiated to promote and secure poor people’s rights and access to safe water, improved sanitation and hygiene education through capacity building and advocacy in the two target counties of Kilifi and Kwale, in the Kenya coast.

FINDINGS

Relevance: The project was highly relevant for supporting the effective implementation of devolution in Kenya, and demonstrating the value of inclusive governance and social accountability in service delivery. By targeting both duty bearers and rights holders and sensitizing them on their respective roles in the county development cycle, the project has activated the essential ingredients that will stimulate long term change in the two target counties.

Effectiveness: The project strategy was largely effective based on the quality and quantity of results achieved, even though a small number of activities could not be completed. Effectiveness was especially demonstrated in the compounded outcomes of the school and community WASH mobilization in Kilifi, and the support to inclusive planning, policy making and social accountability work in Kwale County. Kwale, in particular has emerged as a prime example of how civil society can drive and shape the governance structures and policy making for WASH and environmental issues. However, project’s dissatisfaction with the devolution work in Kilifi, points to the need for improved social organization and building ownership among stakeholder’s in the county.

Impact: In both target counties, the project has established several key milestones for county level environmental and WASH management, as well as institutionalizing principles of effective governance. One of the most important results from this project is the heightened public awareness in terms of information that has found its way into the public domain on WASH governance and management, including knowledge of the Water Act, the five-year county strategic planning process, spatial planning and other WASH related policies. The project also has supported the institutionalization of sound WASH practices in target schools and in community health management structures that include provisions for social accountability and community participation in the operation and maintenance of existing WASH infrastructure.

Efficiency: Efficiency was well-built into the design of the project. By engaging in interventions that strengthen existing county, community and school structures, and trigger systematic results towards the higher goals of improved governance and better WASH outcomes, the project was able to efficiently target its resources and optimize results. The project’s initiative to further create opportunities for channeling other stakeholders’ resources towards its objectives also contributed to efficiency.

Sustainability: The sustainability strategy for the project was premised on two principle: i) capacity building of both duty bearers and rights holders, and ii) strengthening existing community structures. This strategy has to a large extent been achieved. However, a few elements that may not achieve sustainability without additional effort, especially the civil society organization and stakeholder engagement in Kilifi.

KEWASNET should consider finding opportunities to continue engaging Kilifi stakeholders to build on the foundations that the project has established.

KEY CHALLENGES

- ***Delays and Disruptions of Activities*** - Some leadership changes following the 2017 elections created knowledge gaps that affected the smooth flow of project activities. With the governance aspects of the project requiring close interaction with government officials, disruptive political transitions often have a considerable effect on project schedules and quality of delivery. The project also experienced disruptions during the unusually heavy rains that in the months of April and May 2018, which had an effect on timely implementation of some of the planned interventions.
- ***Staff Turnover*** - County staff changes and the high turnover of teachers was a major set-back for project activities. A midway change of Public Health Chief Officer in Kwale slowed down the community WASH component in the county. In Kilifi, school WASH activities faced interruptions due to frequent transfer of teachers. The project had to train several batches of teachers in order to mitigate against gaps and stagnation.
- ***Limited Ownership*** - Duty bearers especially in Kilifi County demonstrated limited ownership of the process, by their reluctance to attend interphase meetings without substantial allowances. In Kwale County by contrast, department staff were reported to be proactively engaged in project activities and initiated meetings without solicitation of allowances.
- ***Uncompleted activities*** - A few project activities could not be completed, a shortcoming attributed mainly to a slight delay in the implementation kick-off and the protracted dispute over the outcome of the 2017 elections.

KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

- ***Active Monitoring*** - The limitations of project change data especially reflecting impact in schools and in the community WASH intervention demands for a future incorporation of active and participatory monitoring tools to be utilized by local administrators, school management, teachers and pupils. Such a tool would help assess a number of important indicators of change like the level of school ownership and contribution delivered, and tracking school performance against specified success indicators. This kind of active monitoring and scoring tool can further be utilized to compare and rank participating schools or communities, which will motivate and improve ownership.
- ***Continued improvement of training methods and tools*** - There is need for continued research on effective training techniques and materials for adults in different settings and contexts. For instance, rights holders and duty bearers appreciated the simplified version of Water Act 2016 with pictorial illustrations. However, for the coast, a further translation of such materials into Kiswahili, the endemic language would be ideal. For community WASH, pockets of resistance were associated with cultural variations on gender and social interactions.
- ***Outcome oriented monitoring*** - The future programme should ensure an outcome oriented results framework that facilitates outcome monitoring as opposed to activity focus.

- ***Varying Regional Contexts*** - In order to further enhance DPA's approach to WASH governance, future work should consider comparing counties from different regional contexts. The selection of Kwale and Kilifi to participate in the project was premised on, among other things, their similar historical marginalization and inadequacy of WASH services. However, the project could also have been enriched with more learning opportunities from varied contexts.
- ***Retention of County Technical Staff*** – Effective capacity building in WASH governance requires institutional continuity, hence the need for mitigating against disruption. The high turnover of county and school staff experienced during the course of project implementation disrupted progress. KEWASET and other WASH partners should therefore find ways of targeting this challenge in ongoing and future advocacy work.
- ***Continued engagement in Kilifi*** - KEWASNET should find opportunities to continue engagement with both rights holders and duty bearers in Kilifi, especially to strengthen social organization aspects as well as to trigger a more responsive engagement and ownership of duty bearers.
- ***Sustaining CLTS*** - Although the project has performed well and produced good results in triggering community WASH, more intervention should be directed at community mobilization, in order to deepen the process and ensure the integration of other aspects such as nutrition and gender. The hygiene interventions carried out also exposed a need for more interventions especially in the rural areas.

1. INTRODUCTION

This report provides the findings of the final evaluation of the project: *“Strengthening Citizens’ Influence on WASH in the newly Devolved Governance System in Kwale and Kilifi Counties in Kenya.”* The two-year project was implemented by the Kenya Water and Sanitation Network (KEWASNET), with support from Danish People’s Aid (DPA) and major funding from *Danmarks Indsamling* (DI). The project was initiated to promote and secure poor people’s rights and access to safe water, improved sanitation and hygiene education through capacity building and advocacy in the two target counties of Kilifi and Kwale, both located on the Indian Ocean Coast of Kenya. Its immediate objectives were:

- Objective 1: Right holders in the two counties are empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end of 2018 including relevant WASH county bills;
- Objective 2: Right holders in the two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county’s delivery of WASH services by the end of 2018;
- Objective 3: Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services.

1.1. Background and Implementation Context

Kenya enacted a new constitution in 2010, which recognizes access to water and sanitation as a basic and legal right of all Kenyans, consequently giving local citizens the right to demand efficient water and sanitation services. The same constitution also has established 47 local governments (Counties) with an annual 15% national budget allocation, with the aim of devolving governance and bringing services closer to the people.

DPA’s timely and relevant strategy for the changing context of governance in Kenya, has focused its WASH interventions on facilitating citizen participation in governance processes. With civil society being a vital part of devolution in supporting advocacy for better service delivery, DPA has further invested in the facilitation of interactions between rights holders and duty bearers that advocate social accountability.

The project, which was initiated by KEWASNET in May 2017, with the overall objective of contributing towards increased citizen’s engagement and duty bearer’s responsiveness for improved WASH service delivery in Kwale and Kilifi, ended in December 2018.

KEWASNET is an indigenous non – governmental membership organization with a mission to promote good governance in the water, sanitation and hygiene sector. It works within the overall national strategy of encouraging networking, collaboration and corporation of CSOs, Private Sector Organizations, and individuals keen on advocating for sustainable universal access to safe water sanitation and hygiene

1.2. Project Targets

The rationale for targeting the coastal counties stems from a combination of factors associated with the region’s historical marginalization and rapidly increasing and urbanizing population which have over-run basic service infrastructure, presenting significant water and hygiene challenges; as well as environmental degradation and severe impact of climate change and arid conditions. The counties were also facing

challenges of unpacking the new devolution policies, which was undermining service delivery. According to a survey by the Kenya National Bureau of Statistics and Society for International Development, Kwale and Kilifi counties lead in the country's poverty index with the residents experiencing problems of low income, expenditure and immense inequality.¹ Often living beyond the reach of government services, rural families are left without clean drinking water, weak village infrastructure and limited access to basic education and healthcare.² In addition, geographical and climatic characteristics leave them to cope with drought, dependent on degraded natural resources for survival.³

The project primarily targeted 320 citizens (right holders), 160 from each county, mobilized from the existing civil Society Organizations (NGOs and CBOs) for training and engagement in the county planning, policy making and social accountability. The 320 were to be the community resource for structured citizen participation. During the targeting process, attention was paid to incorporation of marginalized groups including women and people with disability. The project also targeted children in the primary school system. Two primary schools in the two counties were reached (through CHAST) which have a reach of the expected number of 600 children.

2. METHODOLOGY

The main aim of the evaluation was to collect and systematize experience from the project, and especially to carry out a comparative analysis in relation to a similar DPA project implemented by Maji na Ufanisi (MNU) in the same region. The study focused on capturing the key outcomes of the KEWASNET project, while drawing similarities and differences between the two projects with the aim of determining important lessons to inform and guide the strategy of future interventions. The evaluation involved the use of standard Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria for capturing the project's performance in terms of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact and Sustainability. The methodology largely used qualitative approaches to answer the pre-set evaluation questions and to gather views from the various categories of stakeholders consulted. Primary data was collected through interviews and focused discussions. Secondary data was collected from project documents and the project baseline survey. The MNU project evaluation report provide the resource for comparative analysis.

¹ Baseline Report, 9March 2018), *"Strengthening Citizen's Influence I the Newly Devolved Govrnance System in Kilifi and Kwale Counties of Kenya"* Project, KEWASNET/DPA.

² Ibid.

³ Ibid.



Table 1: Expected Project Outputs and Indicators

Overall Development Objective	Immediate Objective	Summary of Expected Outputs	Indicators (By the end of the project...)	Means of verification
to promote and secure poor people's rights and access to safe water, improved sanitation and hygiene education through capacity building and advocacy in the two target counties of Kilifi and K	Objective 1 – Rights holders in the two counties empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end of 2018 including relevant county WASH Bills.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 320 right holders in the two counties have improved understanding of devolution on WASH issues and actively participate in the County WASH planning process; - Rights holders in the two counties have contributed to the development of relevant County WASH-related Bills; - Right holders related to selected schools in the two counties have improved WASH understanding and practices and are empowered to demand accountability in the Counties' delivery of WASH services; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rights holders will have increased knowledge and awareness of basic rights including WASH rights - Rights holders will be actively involved in the county development planning and county WASH related Bills. - Rights holders have gathered evidence based input, which can be used to advocate for accountability in the county delivery of WASH Services - Rights holders have presented input into the county planning of WASH - Duty bearers have an increased understanding of the devolved governance system and their role in it with regards to delivering WASH services. - There will be increased interaction between right holders and duty bearers with regard to WASH planning and implementation.. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Comparisons with baseline survey - Documentation of participation at meetings - Copies of evidence of information WASH advocacy - Minutes and documentation of meetings between rights holders and duty bearers
	Objective 2 – Rights holders in the two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county delivery of WASH services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Right holders in the two counties have increased understanding of their role as responsible citizens in devolved county structure and in the maintenance of WASH services; - Right holders understand and effectively use social Accountability tools to keep duty bearers accountable on WASH services. - Duty bearers in the two counties capacity built on relevant WASH issues including inclusive planning. 		
	Objective 3 – Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services			

3. PROGRESS OF ACHIEVEMENTS TOWARDS PROJECT OBJECTIVES

The project was generally implemented as planned even though activities kicked off in June 2017, later than had been anticipated in March 2017. The project nevertheless completed most outlined activities and covered the intended beneficiary populations, and even to some extent, exceeding the specified targets.

3.1. *Objective 1: Rights Holders in the Two Counties Empowered to Actively Participate in and Influence County WASH Planning Processes by End of 2018 Including Relevant County WASH Bills.*

3.1.1. Citizen Understanding of Devolution and Participation in County Planning

In both counties, the draft County Integrated Development Plans (CIDP) were completed with the participation of citizens. In facilitating community participation in the county planning and budgeting process, the project began with civic engagement targeting county staff, private sector, as well as the community and sensitized all key stakeholders on their respective roles and responsibilities in devolution. Stakeholder workshops also to some extent targeted Members of the County Assembly (MCAs).

The strategy for engaging citizens in the planning involved initial public meetings held to empower citizens about the government and how planning works in devolution, ahead of the county public participation schedules. When the government called for the public participation, the respective county stakeholders were ready and able to submit Memoranda containing citizen views to the respective county planning departments.

The planning process kicked off with a review of the County Integrated Development Plan (CIDP1) of the previous five year plan, which revealed a number of gaps in analysis and unimplemented projects. In Kwale, the civil society network further invited Members of the County Assembly Environmental Committee to sensitize them on the citizens views outlined in a public memorandum. The resulting CIDP2 therefore provided a structured public participation involving citizens, CSOs, government agencies, professional and the private sector, with tangible projects proposals based on analyses reflecting community needs, and completed through a well-informed legislative process in the County Assembly which approved the document.

According to the Kwale County Natural Resource Network (KCNRN), the civil society organization involved in the facilitation, almost 80 percent of the citizens inputs were captured in the second CIDP, has been enriched with analysis and evidence based project proposals that address a number of existing challenges including improving access to water supply, waste management, agriculture and climate change.

“Although not 100% of citizen views have been taken but even if 50% is taken then that is a lot of progress,” an official of the KCNRN stated during the evaluation interview.

Specifically on WASH, the project successfully advocated for the inclusion of public sanitation blocks in specific urban centres and in the key markets facilities throughout the county into the county plan.

Kwale town currently only has two public toilets. Kwale has seven mobile markets and a number of permanent markets that have no access to sanitation facilities. The project also successfully advocated for increase in the county's WASH Budget, from KES 240 million in the fiscal year 2017/18 to KES 1.87 billion in 2018/19⁴. Kwale's CIDP1 by comparisons had no public participation, contrary to the 2010 Constitution and was poorly informed in situational analysis blamed for mis-allocation of resources.

3.1.2. Citizen Participation in County Legislation and Policy Making

Citizen participation in county policy making was more pronounced in Kwale County, where civic engagement activities culminated in a public memorandum containing citizen views that were incorporated into the 2002 Water Act, as well as citizen contribution to Kwale's Water Tower Policy. Protection of water towers, a source of most rivers, is considered crucial to the sustainability of water resources in Kenya and has a key role in the productive economic sectors such as agriculture, livestock, industry, energy and tourism. Therefore under the coordination of the Kenya Water Tower Agency (KwTA), each county is required to develop its Water Tower Policy outlining measures and actions to conserve the fragile ecosystems increasingly under threat from the rapid population growth and encroachment resulting deforestation and associated effects.

Also in Kwale, the public participated in the development of the County's first spatial plan, a requirement under the County Government Act 2012, which calls on County Governments to prepare and implement GIS-based plans mapping planned use of available spaces, natural resources such as water catchment areas and their sustainable use, projected land use patterns that enhance the protection of marine and forest conservation and minimizing encroachment. By the time of the evaluation, the spatial planning process in Kwale County was ongoing and a final draft of the spatial plan is expected by end of June 2019.

In Kilifi, through the project advocacy, the County has incorporated citizen inputs into the enacted Water and Sanitation Bill, based on the public memorandum submitted to the county for legislation.

3.2. Objective 2: Rights Holders in the Two Counties Empowered to Demand Accountability in the County Delivery of WASH Services

3.2.1. School WASH Component

Under school WASH, the project targeted two primary schools, one in each county, to participate (through CHAST activities), and was expected to reach at least 600 children, with at least 50% of them being girls. The identification of the schools Isaac Nyondo (Kilifi) and the remotely located Malungoni (Kwale), was done with support from County Public Health Officers, who had marked them as priority areas of focus in terms of sanitation and hygiene. Both schools had poor access to safe water and hygiene and sanitation, making them unsafe places where diseases were regularly transmitted with overall negative effects on the health and academic development of children.

The school programme targeted WASH education components addressing water supply, hand washing and waste management. Unlike the MNU project, which also included a hardware component for two schools, the KEWASNET project did not include funding for school infrastructure. The programme started with training of teachers, the school management boards, Parents & Teachers

⁴ Kwale County Annual Plan (2018/19)

Association (community members), and the local chiefs. This was followed by the activation of school environment clubs, with the incorporation of a WASH. Although the clubs had existed prior to the project, they had largely been inactive and hygiene issues were not incorporated into their activities. Both schools also had no handwashing facilities. The training content for the school programme included environmental cleanliness, OD and its negative effect on the public health and environment, food hygiene, hand washing, and menstrual hygiene. There was also a specific input on gender roles in WASH, especially in menstrual hygiene involving sensitization of fathers and school boys targeting their attitudes and behavior towards girls' menstrual hygiene.

The programme is credited with increasing cleanliness in both schools, with club members motivated with T-Shirts provided through the project. Both schools were reported to have taken ownership of hygiene management within their respective premises, ensuring the school clubs are well established and running and through the provision of hand washing facilities. In Kilifi, the Isaac Nyondo school administration took the initiative of constructing a hand washing facility with running taps as a result of the programme, while Malunguni, which is a considerably poorer with weak school infrastructure and lacks access to piped water, has purchased large hand washing containers with taps for the same purpose. Although the school utilizes pit latrines, the level of sanitation practices were also reported to have improved.

The clubs in both schools have since their activation, engaged in popularizing hand washing in school through regular training and demonstration as well as engaging pupils in toilet and environment cleaning, while being ambassadors for hygiene at home and within their respective community. The menstrual hygiene components was further boosted by the government's decision in 2018, to distribute free pads for girls to all schools in the county. As a result of the programme, the number of children reached has exponentially exceeded the initial target of 600 children, having benefitted 10 other primary schools in both counties and one secondary school in Kilifi, in addition to the impact on surrounding communities.

Isaac Nyondo Primary School - The evaluation specifically assessed activities at Isaac Nyondo Primary School, located in Rabai, Kilifi County. The school, established by Christian missionaries in 1848 has a current population of 1085 pupils (554 boys and 531girls). The school management expressed a high level of satisfaction with the project's added value to the school and community.

“Diarrhea was a major challenge in the school and the community and all that has improved. We have improved a lot. Menstrual hygiene also targeted men and their mental attitude especially fathers to care more for their daughters and boys to stop mocking them,” a teacher at Isaac Nyondo Primary School said.

To further enhance and complement the school WASH outputs, the school became a platform from which the local community was engaged in sanitation and hygiene promotion activities as well as the venue for marking major WASH celebrations. This platform also served as a venue for the engagement of the local community in the development of the public memoranda for the county WASH legislation as well as the county strategic planning process.

“We were able to get them to contribute and compliment what they are doing. Sanitation and hygiene has improved, and we eventually expect performance to improve. The school clubs are the sustainability strategy,” a project team member stated.

With most villages represented at the school, the knowledge was reported to have trickled down to the community, positively impacting of their attitude and practice. The element of child to child influence and the motivation of public health officials who led the coordinated effort also contributed to the results. Local chiefs on their part, have been utilizing their *barazas* as platforms for hygiene education and sensitization to the community, while at the same time using their staff to monitor hygiene compliance. Communities were also engaged in self-monitoring, which was reported to have contributed to ending OD in the surrounding households. Teachers, who have been trained indicated using their free time in the community to share WASH messages.

The good results obtained in the community WASH in Kilifi County, was also credited with the County's Community Health Strategy currently being rolled out, which integrates WASH into the community health governance structures on the ground. These structures, known as Community Health Committees, work with community health workers and volunteers who maintain contacts with households, supporting disseminating information on health issues, nutrition, and WASH. The coverage of this strategy with service delivery focus, has reached 33 percent of the county and was the vehicle through which much of the project's community WASH delivery was done. Even in areas still uncovered by the community health strategy, the county used CLTS community based promoters to work with public health officers to deliver on the WASH education.

In Kwale, the community WASH education was done in collaboration with the civil society organization known as KWAHO, which facilitated community training on hygiene and sanitation as well as organized and trained local committees on the proper management of WASH structures. This involved mobilizing community representative from each Ward in Kwale County for training as community trainers who would go back and impart the knowledge to their respective communities.

Mapping was conducted to identify and ensure CSOs were available to assist in mobilizing and facilitating project activities. The identified CSOs also assisted in the targeting of community participants ensuring age and gender inclusivity as well as representation of people with disabilities. The project reported a 67% success rate against OD, with the remaining 33% attributed to pockets of resistance felt in two sub-counties namely Kinango and Lungalunga, due to complex beliefs around social and gender norms, a factor which requires building of consistency in the programme to maintain the success and to capture the resistant pockets.

3.2.2. Community Participation in WASH Infrastructure Operation and Maintenance

The project also had a community component on WASH infrastructure targeting vandalism and community ownership of operation and maintenance (O&M). This component worked particularly well in Kwale, which is more organized in this area, with the county government having picked up on the need for the community to own infrastructure maintenance following successful civic education through CSO dialogue platforms that the project helped to strengthen.

The project also facilitated interphase meetings between duty bearers and rights holders. In order to widen infrastructure awareness KEWASNET brought other stakeholders on board, through a process that began with a two-day stakeholder workshop which mapped stakeholder support including their WASH funding. A total of two interphase meetings were held – one in Kilifi and one in Kwale – bringing together different people and organizations, to enhance participants' knowledge of hygiene and sanitation issues and the need to improve water services to the people. The Kwale consultations in 2018 was reported to have gone well, with national media coverage. Through these consultations, the

private sector also was reported to have been drawn into supporting some aspects of O&M. For example, the Aga Khan Foundation, which had funding for WASH, committed to facilitating establishment of a free SMS hotline platform for public use in reporting challenges with WASH services in Kwale county.

The Network also secured support of the Integrity Action UK to support O&M and social accountability, through funding of community monitors to be trained in the use of its Community Integrity Model training, involving the use of iLED manufactured hand held devices with a specific application that facilitates a structured process of infrastructure contract monitoring. The training was also facilitated in collaboration with county engineers who assisted community monitors to understand the aspects of engineering that should be incorporated, such as the quality of materials to be used.

This collaborative approach which brought in other partners on board has expanded the gains from the initial planned project activities. The aspect of coordination and collaboration was also achieved by allowing each stakeholder to support the part they want. At the same time, the project also successfully advocated for WASH infrastructure maintenance component, within the Kwale annual budget, which caters for WASH maintenance training targeting the same community committees to take ownership and protect infrastructure from vandalism.

In Kilifi, where the consultation were not successful, the project team felt that more such interphase meetings should be conducted following a successful cross learning with Kwale. The plan to hold stakeholders consultative forums and conduct trainings of individual focal points as WASH champions or focal points on hygiene promotion, also did not take place due to clashing calendars of stakeholders.

3.2.3. Social Accountability

Social accountability also worked well in Kwale, where the project was able to successfully petition the County Chief Government Officer to allow the public to independently participate in the monitoring of government implementation of WASH projects. The county government not only provided the project with a supporting letter for the citizen monitoring role, but also the respective Bills of Quantities (BoQs), and contract agreements which enabled them to visit and review of 24 county WASH projects. At the point which the project visited and assessed the ongoing county WASH projects, a number of key issues were identified among them misuse of public funds. Some contractors had abandoned their projects midway through implementation, others were delayed and some even vandalized. At the same time, the beneficiary communities had no awareness regarding the cost of the projects and the process involved in their procurement.

The project established and trained community WASH project monitoring teams on project supervision through the use of the donated I-LED hand-held devices with specific project monitoring applications. KEWASNET had developed a tool for project monitoring in the field but did not find an opportunity to test it with the local project committees.

Also under social accountability, a joint working group which is a technical platform deliberating on status and progress of WASH issues in Kwale, has been established and shared between the Kwale county government and the KEWASNET, KCNRN, the Aga Khan Foundation (which has invested a lot of resources in WASH and sustainable irrigation programmes) has been established and an engineer.

In terms of WASH implementation, the same County Director of Water is also the Director of service provider Kwale Water and Sewerage Company (KWAWASCO). He also is a member of the Joint Working Group, which enhances coordination between the various stakeholders on WASH governance and infrastructure development.

By the time of the evaluation, contractors for 18 WASH infrastructure projects were reported to have returned and resumed works, out of which 5 had completed. To date, 24 projects had been completed. Cases of misallocation of resources have significantly reduced as a result of this initiative. With a more sensitized County Assembly also means projects are better scrutinized before being passed.

“This was the first time we received support from county authorities to establish mechanism for social accountability for WASH projects in the County.”

3.3. Objective 3: Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services

Stakeholders were generally happy with the progress made with authorities in both counties especially in their incorporation of citizens’ views in county plans. Kwale in particular, has done well with the project having fostered a positive working relationship between county departments and civil society, also reflected in quality of county plans and policies, even though some officers were still being perceived to be resisting change.

For example, following strong lobbying by rights holders, the water services budget for Kwale County has significantly improved from a meagre KES 240 million in the fiscal year 2017/18 to KES 1.87 billion in 2018/19. Out of this sum, KES 25 million has been allocated to operations and maintenance, while 1.8 billion will go to WASH development.

County authorities also have become more receptive and have demonstrated this not only through direct engagements with civil society but also by further incorporating at least five of the civil society network members into various county committees. Another example is the county’s demonstrated support for the local civil society network, by providing it with funds (KES 500,000) in 2017 to carry out public awareness creation and advocacy on a pressing environmental issue caused by a Chinese construction company, which was extracting sand from the sea for building a new railway line, thereby posing a threat to the marine ecosystem. Through a vigorous media campaign and a court battle, the network achieved its objective by winning case in which the company was ordered to find sand from other sources. Local citizens also have become more vigilant and regularly report such illegal activities.

“When you go to government offices, they now pay attention, and their behavior has changed. They understand that they work for the public.”

Kilifi by comparison, has allocated KES 701.5⁵ million to water and sanitation services in 2018/19, and is not considered to have been as active as Kwale in regards to citizen engagement with the devolution processes, and therefore did not achieve the kind of extensive results reported in Kwale with regards to citizen input into WASH policy making, planning and social accountability.

The weaker results in this regard was mostly associated with the poor approach initially used by the leading civil society network, which was more oriented towards confrontational activism which often failed to yield cooperation from duty bearers. A number of initial meetings organized by KEWASNET between the local Kilifi County Natural Resource Network (KCNRN) and Kilifi County officials reportedly often ended in conflicts and “finger Pointing” to an extent that the project team avoided inviting the media to the events.

Remedial efforts by the project involved activities aimed at shifting the network’s orientation towards a more cooperative attitude towards county authorities. The project organized two cross learning workshops that brought together the members of the participating Kilifi and Kwale civil society network in order to exchange experiences and learnings on their respective roles in the project. This intervention resulted in among others, the development of a plan of action for 2019, which both groups were reported to have completed.

4. KEY OUTCOMES

4.1. Relevance

The project was highly relevant for supporting the effective implementation of devolution in Kenya, and demonstrating the value of inclusive governance and social accountability in service delivery. By targeting both duty bearers and rights holders and sensitizing them on their respective roles in the county development cycle, the project has activated the essential ingredients that will stimulate long term change in the two target counties. The project was also relevant in terms of engaging citizens in taking ownership of public health and hygiene through the involvement of children in school and community engagement in WASH education, directing positive change in attitudes, behavior and practices.

4.2. Effectiveness

The project strategy was largely effective based on the quality and quantity of results achieved, even though a small number of activities could not be completed. Effectiveness was especially demonstrated in the compounded outcomes of the school and community WASH mobilization especially in Kilifi, and the inclusive planning, policy making and social accountability work in Kwale County.

Kwale - Kwale, in particular has emerged as a prime example of how Civil Society can drive and shape the governance structures and policy making for WASH and environmental issues. The project’s work through a strong civil society network has helped build up an effective and sustained base for advocacy, which promises good governance of WASH and other important sectors. KEWASNET and its CSO network, have centrally mobilized communities to play an active role in the formulation of

⁵ Kilifi Annual Plan and Budget for fiscal year 2018/10

county policies and legislations, and at the same utilized the project's platform to synergize efforts and resources of other stakeholders in order to increase the impact of the project advocacy work.

Stakeholders consulted reported significant improvement in Kwale among communities involved in the consultations in respect to their knowledge of the structure of governance in the county as well as the impact of their behavior on the environment. The project also has impacted on the behavior of local government staff who previously had a culture refusing to share information to the public.

Kilifi - Kilifi's success in the eradication of OD in target areas, was majorly credited to the delivery of the project WASH education through both the school programme targeting children and the use of the existing public health governance structures on the ground, with community health workers disseminating information to households. Direct project interaction in community WASH activities only involved the mobilization of community was only done during the commemorations of the major events and also in the distribution of materials mainly T-shirts and fliers.

However, stakeholder dissatisfaction with the devolution work in Kilifi, points to the need of more work towards improving social organization in the county, ensuring the civil society network is built to a level where it can own, follow up, and sustain the foundational work done by the DPA project to the extent achieved in Kwale.

Uncompleted Activities - Effectiveness, was also affected by a number of uncompleted activities attributed to a late start and interruptions from the contentious 2017 elections and heavy annual rains. The activities affected include:

- Training for duty bearers on sanitation and hygiene in Kilifi, a shortcoming attributed to a clash of schedules with county government plans. The activity initially scheduled for November 2018 was missed and overtaken by the project closure in December 2018.
- Tools for monitoring project implementation and social accountability were developed by KEWASNET and training conducted for stakeholders in both counties. However, the project did not find an opportunity to facilitate the communities to practice with the tools on county projects. While Kwale had the opportunity to use iLED held devices for that purpose, Kilifi in particular missed out on the chance.
- End survey was not carried out, hence the scarcity of statistical data to assess the impact of project activities in the target schools, in terms of attendance and performance.

4.3. Impact

In both target counties, the project has established several key milestones for county level environmental and WASH management, as well as principles and of effective governance.

Heightened Public Awareness & Knowledge Transfer - One of the most important results from this project is the heightened public awareness in terms of information that has found its way into the public domain on WASH management and civic education on devolution and WASH, including knowledge of the Water Act, the five year county strategic planning, spatial planning and other WASH related policies, which have further been made visible through mass media tools. Citizens were reported to be more aware of the policies that affect them, resulting in a more conscious public able to hold their government to account. The impact of this knowledge transfer on the local attitudes in Kwale is illustrated by the proactivity among citizens to initiate their own conversations under trees

about local governance issues, unlike previously when they rarely attended events without transport and lunch money.

Long Term Impact – The project also has supported the institutionalization of sound WASH management structures at the county and community level especially on community health, county planning, social accountability and O&M of WASH infrastructure. Although the results for inclusive WASH governance are most immediately pronounced in Kwale, the foundation established by the project forms the basis for how governance in both counties will be conducted in the future.

School WASH - Hygiene promotion has been well appreciated in the two identified primary schools in Kilifi and Kwale Counties. The schools have built ownership of the programme, and have contributed funds that went into procuring hand washing facilities. Through the clubs the schools have become centres for knowledge resource for surrounding schools and respective communities. The good results were reported to have created demand among other surrounding schools for similar hygiene promotion intervention, which was beyond the scope of the project. However, through the school clubs, 12 other primary schools in both counties and one secondary school in Kilifi have been reached with hygiene and sanitation training.

Behavior Change - The project's engagements with rights holders on WASH infrastructure operation and maintenance (O&M) has had a considerable influence on how citizens perceive public infrastructure, especially in Kwale County, where communities have taken strong ownership of WASH facilities, resulting in improved services through their better use and protection from vandalism.

Improved Working Relations between CSOs and County Authorities - The working relationship between the county and stakeholders especially in Kwale, has dramatically grown during the duration of project implementation, to the extent that the county began incorporating members of the civil society network into its environmental technical committees during the life of the project. The County duty bearers also are engaged in a joint technical working group with CSOs and other stakeholders on WASH matters. The county decision to donate funds towards the local CSO advocacy agenda, was especially a turning point in signaling major change of behavior on the part of Kwale county authorities. In Kilifi, the relationship between stakeholders and county authorities was reported to be improving despite a rough start.

Improved Community Hygiene - Although specific change data was not readily available, the impact of community level sanitation and hygiene education also was considered to be significant, with most villages being certified as OD free, although more work needs to be done for complete CLTS immersion in order to break the cycle in the remaining pockets of resistance and build sustainability.

Knowledge Transfer to KEWASNET: The exchange of knowledge between the project and other KEWASNET WASH projects, is considered to have contribution towards future KEWASNET programming. For example, KEWASNET developed some training tools on areas of social accountability for use in other WASH programmes, but was able also to utilize then in the DPA project trainings. It was also apparent that the project also contributed KEWASNET's growth by expanding its knowledge to its network members.

4.4. Efficiency

Efficiency was well-built into the design of the project. By engaging in interventions that strengthen existing county, community and school structures and trigger systematic results towards the higher goals of improved governance and better WASH outcomes, the project was able to efficiently target its resources and optimize results.

The project's initiative to further create opportunities for channeling other stakeholders' resources towards its objectives also contributed to efficiency and optimized results. The project has further triggered new opportunities of external support for the county. For example, in December 2018, the county received sponsorship from the Institute of Law and Environmental Governance (ILEG) for three officials to participate in a benchmarking mission in South Africa. Efficiency was also demonstrated in the introduction of cross learnings meetings between Kwale and Kilifi CSO networks in order to improve the quality of advocacy towards duty bearers in Kilifi and mitigate against failure.

4.5. Sustainability

The sustainability strategy for the project was premised on two pillars: i) capacity building of both duty bearers and rights holders, and ii) strengthening existing community structures. This strategy has to a large extent been achieved. However, a few elements that may not achieve sustainability without additional effort, especially the civil society organization and stakeholder engagement in Kilifi. KEWASNET should consider finding opportunities to continue engaging Kilifi stakeholders to build on the foundations that the project has established. Special attention should also be placed on the dissemination of already developed tools and manuals for ease of use by stakeholders. Further effort will also be required in building consistency and sustainability in community WASH. The project carried out mainly an overview of the hygiene promotion and not in CLTS..

5. KEY CHALLENGES AND LESSONS

5.1. Lessons

Results Within Short Term - Positive change with visible impact is possible to achieve, even with a short-term, low level project with small funding, if the project philosophy is well formulated, implementation strategically targeted and the stakeholders obtain the required knowledge and motivation to positively engage action. The KEWASNET project has satisfactorily achieved its objectives, not by directly funding WASH projects but assisting local governments and communities to direct their resources where the priorities are most pressing.

Power of Strong Civil Society Network – The KEWASNET project has demonstrated that a strong civil society network can make a lasting difference as reflected in the contrasting performance between the civil society networks in Kwale and in Kilifi. The Kwale Natural Resources Network was significantly more active than its Kilifi counterpart, with ability to summon and sustain civic action and local resources throughout the County and across sectors. The network's progressively increased access to County resources and bureaucratic engagements also builds a strong basis for project sustainability.

Cross Learnings Between CSOs - Cross learning interactions between CSOs in participating counties should be standardized as a practice in peer learning. The project initiative of bringing together rights holders in Kwale and Kilifi, helped improve the quality of Kilifi CSO network advocacy and was an important motivating factor in improving the county's uptake which was initially slow.

Integrating community in school WASH – In both DPA projects, the use of the school WASH programme as a platform for reaching communities makes sense in terms of value for money and sustainability. In addition to school WASH, the target schools were utilized as a central knowledge resources for the community and also for other surrounding schools. The project also automatically incorporated a community outreach, where the school administration, partnered with parents and local chiefs as “WASH ambassadors”. This approach was not only efficient in optimizing results at both school and community level, but also enhanced sustainability of the school programme, by facilitating continuity for children to practice learned hygiene behavior at home.

Channeling Through Existing Community Health Structures - Channeling the project’s community WASH delivery through the existing county community health structures, and delivering community WASH through community health workers generates effective and lasting change, as it allows long-term integration and institutionalization for sustained delivery and monitoring.

Well Framed Messages - When a message is well framed and delivered to a community, ownership is automatically built, translating into change of behavior and practice, and creates a trickle effect spreading to other communities.

Compounded effect – Just by targeting WASH, both DPA projects have demonstrated transformative impact on overall county governance beyond WASH sector, primarily because the same sensitized participants of WASH intervention are the same stakeholders engaged in the planning and policy making for the other sectors. The behavior change witnessed on the part of county authorities with respect to social accountability on WASH also corresponds to other sectors.

Media Tools - Media involvement in community sensitization and advocacy is a powerful tool, with a multiplying effect, by creating hype around an advocacy issue, as demonstrated by both KEWASNET and MNU projects during public participation in county policy making. The hyped successes around public participation in the compliant counties also is increasingly exerting pressure on other counties to meaningfully commit to inclusive governance.

Emphasizing Civic Education – The KEWASNET project has exposed the extent to which civic education is essential at the local levels. While the national government has made significant progress in enacting environmental policies and legislations such as the Water Act, Environment Policy, and ODF roadmap, it should generally not be assumed that these policies are automatically disseminated or understood at the county level. The Water Act 2016 for example, was simplified and disseminated through the project, but served not only rights holders, but also to a large extent duty bearers.

5.2. Challenges

Delays and Disruptions of Activities - Some leadership changes following the 2017 elections created knowledge gaps that affected the smooth flow of project activities. With the governance aspects of the project requiring close interaction with government officials, disruptive political transitions often have a considerable effect on project schedules and quality of delivery. The project also experienced disruptions during the unusually heavy rains that in the months of April and May 2018, affecting had effect on participation of planned interventions especially on time.

Staff Turnover - County staff changes and the high turnover of teachers was a major set-back for project activities. A midway change of Public Health Chief Officer in Kwale slowed down the

community WASH component in the county. In Kilifi, school WASH activities faced interruptions due to frequent transfer of teachers. The project had to train several batches of teachers in order to mitigate stagnation during gap periods.

Limited Ownership - Duty bearers especially in Kilifi County demonstrated limited ownership off the process, by their reluctance to attend interphase meetings without substantial allowances. In Kwale County by contrast, department staff were reported to be happy to engage in project activities and initiate meetings without solicitation of allowances.

Uncompleted activities - The project activities could not all be completed, due partly to the delayed start and also the disruptive 2017 elections which also affected the target counties.

6. KEY RECOMMENDATIONS

Active Monitoring - The limitations of project change data especially reflecting change in schools and in the community demands for future incorporation of active and participatory monitoring tools to be utilized by local administrations, school management, teachers and pupils. Such a tool would help assess a number of important indicators of change such as level of school preparedness to participate, ownership and contribution delivered, and tracking performance against specified indicators. This kind of active monitoring and scoring tool can further be utilized to compare and rank participating schools or communities will also be motivating and improve ownership and levels of engagement.

Continued improvement of training methods and tools - There is need for continued research on how effective training techniques and materials for adults in different settings and contexts. For instance, right holders and duty bearers appreciated the simplified version of Water Act 2016 with pictorial illustrations. However, for the coast, a further translation of such materials into Kiswahili, the endemic language would be ideal. For community WASH, the pockets of resistance were linked to local cultural attitudes on gender and social interactions.

Outcome oriented monitoring - The future programme should ensure an outcome oriented results framework that facilitates outcome monitoring as opposed to activity focus. The Project team felt that the activities were numerous with an element of duplication which overstretched the capacity of the team on the ground to implement in a timely manner. This speaks to the activity rather than outcome focused monitoring framework.

Varying Regional Contexts - In order to further enhance DPA's approach to WASH governance, future work should consider comparing counties from different regional contexts. The selection of Kwale and Kilifi to participate in the project was premised on, among other things, their similar historical marginalization and inadequacy of WASH services. However, the project could also have been enriched with more learning opportunities from varied contexts.

Retention of County Technical Staff – Effective capacity building in WASH governance requires institutional continuity, hence the need for mitigating against disruption. The high turnover of county and school staff experienced during the course of project implementation should therefore be targeted in ongoing and future advocacy work.

Continued engagement in Kilifi - KEWASNET should find opportunities to continue engagement with both rights holders and duty bearers in Kilifi, Kilifi especially to strengthen social organization aspects as well as to trigger a more responsive engagement and ownership of duty bearers.

Sustaining CLTS - Although the project has performed well and produced good results in triggering community WASH, more intervention should be directed at community mobilization, in order to deepen the process and ensure the integration of other aspects such as nutrition and gender. The hygiene interventions carried out also exposed a need for more interventions especially in the rural areas.

7. ANNEX

ANNEX 1: Comparative Analysis – KEWASNET/MNU DPA projects

ANNEX 2: Project Log Frame & results

ANNEX 3: List of Evaluation Participants

ANNEX 4: TORs for External Evaluation

ANNEX 5: List of Documents Reviewed

ANNEX 6 (a&b): CSO Plans of Action 2019

ANNEX 7 (a, b, c & d): Public Memoranda to Counties

ANNEX 1

COMPARTIVE ANALYSIS OF THE TWO DPA PROJECTS IN THE KENYAN COAST: KEWASNET (Kwale/Kilifi) and MNU (Mombasa/Taita Taveta)

DPA has supported two similar projects in Kenya, covering four counties namely Mombasa, Taita Taveta Kilifi, and Kwale Counties. The Mombasa/Taita Taveta project was implemented through the NGO Maji na Ufanisi (MNU) and concluded in February 2018. It had a particular focus on citizen participation in local governance and included components of capacity building for participatory planning and citizen demands for social accountability. The project Kilifi/Kwale segment, which was implemented through KEWASNET, ended in December 2018 and currently under review.

The two projects were essentially developed from the same design, both having the same overall development objective and expected outcomes. Although MNU project kicked off much earlier than its KEWASNET counterpart, the implementation schedule of the two overlapped, and therefore provided no sufficient opportunity for one project to benefit from the other's learnings. Hence a comparison between the two is based on the understanding that both projects were implemented somewhat independently from each other.

Nevertheless, the two projects have produced similar ground breaking results, notably in facilitating the institutionalization of inclusive governance in WASH, improved WASH service delivery and improved sanitation and hygiene practices within target counties and communities.

In terms of Relevance, the two projects were both timely in supporting target counties, which were all facing severe WASH and local governance challenges, to unpack and operationalize devolution, at a time when there were no local experiences to learn from.

Both projects demonstrated effectiveness in their execution of WASH advocacy and also efficiently utilized resources to produce compounded results at various level. The impact of both projects on devolution in Kenya were also compounded at county, community and school levels. The Kilifi and Kwale component, however demonstrated more value for money in utilizing established CSO networks to channel WASH education and civic engagement, as well as in build local ownership for school and community WASH infrastructure.

There were nevertheless a number of variations in the outputs and outcomes of the two projects. Table 2 presents a summary of the major characteristics of the two projects including the areas of variation.

Table 2: Summary of Comparison of the two DPA projects

Project Feature	KEWASNET	MNU
Title	Strengthening Citizens' Influence on WASH in the newly Devolved Governance System in Kwale and Kilifi Counties in Kenya.	Strengthening Citizens' Influence on Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) in the Devolved Governance System in Mombasa and Taita Taveta Counties
Overall Project Development Objective	To Contribute to an improved quality of life of the disadvantaged in Kilifi and Kwale counties by improved WASH services.	To contribute to the improved to an improved quality of life of the disadvantaged in Mombasa and Taita Taveta counties improved WASH Services.
Specific Objectives	<p>Objective 1 – Rights holders in the two counties empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end of 2018 including relevant county WASH Bills.</p> <p>Objective 2 – Rights holders in the two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county delivery of WASH services by end of 2018.</p> <p>Objective 3 – Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services</p>	<p>Objective 1- Rights holders in the 2 counties empowered to actively participate in and influence county WASH planning processes by end of 2017 including relevant WASH county bills.</p> <p>Objective 2 - Rights holders in two counties empowered to demand accountability in the county's delivery of WASH services by the end of 2017.</p> <p>Objective 3 - Duty bearers have an improved understanding of their roles and responsibilities within the devolved governance system with regards to inclusive planning and delivery of WASH services.</p>
Targets	Duty Bearers, Rights Holders (CSOs, Communities) in Kilifi, Kwale	Rights holders, Duty bearers in Mombasa and T. Taveta.
Duration	2 Years	36 months (with a two month extension)
Budget	DKK 1,747,725	DKK 2,992,158
CSO advocacy action and delivery	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Utilized existing CSO networks with more experience in conducting advocacy. CSOs integrated WASH advocacy with their thematic area of Environmental and natural resources in county planning. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project established two water action groups as CBOs mobilized from civil society in the grassroots. The two CBOs, were formed from scratch while also active in citizen mobilization and capacity building. The CBOs generally functioned well but received more traction in Taita Taveta, where targeted duty bearers were better engaged on WASH services and social accountability.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The networks had established long term memberships in the grassroots, hence capacity to conduct large scale mobilizations. • CSO network activities in Kwale were intensely targeted and sustained. • Inter county cross learnings facilitated between the CSOs in the two counties. 	
County Planning & Planning & policy making	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structured civic education, public participation and stakeholder meetings to review of the previous development plan, developing public memorandum with citizen views submitted to county planning departments. • Inclusive planning was successful in both Kilifi and Kwale. • Tools for coordination, Planning, Social accountability and O&M are institutionalized. • Rights holders influenced Water Tower policy, Public memorandum for county water Act, County Water Policy, Spatial planning, Water and Sanitation Bill (Kilifi) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning was structured. Citizens produced a public memoranda for incorporation into county development plans and WASH policies. • Inclusive planning and citizen influence in policy making was successful in Taita Taveta, but limited in Mombasa due to resistance from county authorities. • MCWAG dedicated more time to advocacy, to ease access to duty bearers. • Rights holders influenced WASH and environment policies.
Social Accountability & O&M	<p>Structured training and tools developed to systematize Social Accountability & O&M through:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community monitoring of WASH infrastructure implementation • Free SMS hotline for reporting WASH issues to service providers. • Joint technical working group between rights holders and CSO network representatives and other stakeholders and county engineer. • Structured community training (including by engineers) and participation in O&M through the same trained community project monitoring committees., overseen by engineers 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social accountability worked well with service providers MOWASCO and TAVEVO in addressing water supply issues. • Citizens sensitized on vandalism of WASH infrastructure. • Tools for institutionalizing coordination, social accountability and O&M had not been fully developed, with action groups lobbying and sensitizing duty bearers. • Community well sensitized on O&M issues including addressing vandalism. However, no structured mechanism for engagement with duty bearers but interactions with service providers increasingly improved.
Community WASH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Direct community mobilization was limited. Project focused on capacity building of community representatives to be WASH ambassadors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conducted full CLTS
School WASH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two (2) target schools, one in each county. • Programme consisted of only soft component of WASH – hygiene and sanitation education and school clubs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four (4) target schools, 2 in each county. • Programme consisted of both soft and hard components - WASH education, school clubs and WASH infrastructure for two rural poor schools.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participating schools utilized as centres of knowledge for community and other surrounding schools. • WASH international events celebrated at the school and utilized as community mobilization platform. • Schools procured hand washing facilities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Schools influenced hygiene surrounding communities. • Some schools received donations from communities for hygiene and sanitation.
Key Challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2017 elections and heavy rains affected the smooth flow of project activities. • County staff changes and the high turnover of teachers was a major set-back for project activities. • Poor ownership among duty bearers especially in Kilifi demanding allowances to attend meetings. • Few project activities could not be completed, due partly to the delayed start and also the disruptive 2017 elections. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project was implemented in between two general elections of 2013 and 2017 and was therefore subject to the associated political instability and change of office bearers. • The nine-month gap in project implementation occasioned delays that adversely affected the efficiency of the project. Some projects components only were completed after project closure. • Corruption and political interests the main threat to citizen participation, coupled with poor information sharing by county authorities especially in Mombasa. • Lack of WASH budget lines in county plans. • Low motivation of parents to contribute towards school infrastructure O&M.
Key Lessons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A strong CSO network provides is a powerful force in sustained advocacy and change. • Positive change with visible impact is possible to achieve, even with a short-term, low level project if the project philosophy is well formulated. • Cross learning interactions between CSOs in participating counties should be standardized as an effective form of practice in peer learning. • The use of the school WASH programme as a platform for reaching communities makes sense in terms of value for money and sustainability. • Channeling the project's community WASH delivery through existing county community health structures, and delivering community WASH through community health workers generates effective and lasting change. • When a message is well framed and delivered to a community, ownership is automatically built, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project has demonstrated that duty bearers can be responsive to positive engagement of citizens, especially on the part of water service providers. • Though this project, MNU is strategically positioned as an authority in Kenya's devolution process. • This project has demonstrated that schools can effectively become catalysts of community behaviour change. Health clubs is a good model for child peer education as well as community influencer. • The project was planned with the assumption that it would achieve the same results in both target counties, but results varied and better in more rural context than in urban metropolitan. • One of the strengths of this project was the decision to conduct baseline survey and impact assessment. Both are best practices that are useful in benchmarking the impact of the project. Citizen priorities much be guided by long term

	<p>translating into change of behavior and practice, and creates a trickle effect spreading to other communities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Just by targeting WASH, both DPA projects have demonstrated transformative impact on overall county governance beyond WASH sector. Media involvement in community sensitization and advocacy is a powerful tool, creates a multiplying effect. The KEWASNET project has exposed the extent to which civic education is essential at the local levels. 	<p>technical consideration. There was no engineering input to citizen engagement.</p>
Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The limitations of project change data especially reflecting change in schools and in the community demands for future incorporation of active and participatory monitoring tools to be utilized by local administrations, school management, teachers and pupils. • Continued improvement of training methods and tools to cover training needs of adults in different settings and contexts. • The future projects should ensure outcome oriented results frameworks that facilitates outcome monitoring as opposed to activity focus. • In order to further enhance DPA's approach to WASH governance, future work should consider comparing counties from different regional contexts. • Effective capacity building in WASH governance requires institutional continuity, hence the need for advocacy. • KEWASNET should find opportunities to continue engagement with both rights holders and duty bearers in Kilifi to strengthen social organization more responsive engagement and ownership of duty bearers. • More intervention should be directed at community mobilization, in order to deepen community WASH outcomes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More support to the water action groups/CBOs in needed to sustain their growth and effectiveness as citizen representatives and social accountability watchdogs. • Future interventions must incorporate natural water resource conservation and related impacts of climate change as essential elements in rights-based WASH programming in order to link with SDG 6. • Adequate resources for media for highlighting and reporting on water issues is essential to sustained public engagement. • Advocacy should target high county staff turn-over in counties administrations. • Provision of school water should take into account surrounding community water status, to promote sustainable use and prevent vandalism of school infrastructure. • Need to devolve the water action committees to the community level to enhance citizen capacity for advocacy, monitoring, and social accountability . • Continuous capacity building needed for strengthening citizens ability for advocacy and ensure continued dissemination at the grassroots. • County WASH governance programming should tailor and adapt its strategies to each context